**Online Appendix**

**This Online Appendix presents additional information in three parts:**

1. **Issues of Design and Recruitment**
2. **Representativeness**
3. **Comparison of Changes Between Treatment and Control Group (Difference in Differences)**
4. **Moderator Evaluations and Knowledge Gains by Party**
5. **Issues of Design and Recruitment**

The A1R project employs an experimental design using treatment and control groups. The treatment in the project involved being invited to and then participating in A1R as a “delegate.” The control group, also a representative sample of registered voters, was not invited to participate in A1R and therefore did not receive the treatment. The respondents in the treatment and control groups were selected using stratified random sampling from NORC’s probability-based AmeriSpeak® Panel panel. The project selected a nationally representative sample of registered voters from the panel, and then randomly assigned the registered voters to the treatment and control groups. The AmeriSpeak Panel panel is an address based sample of approximately 35,000. The members of the panel were recruited by mail, telephone and personal visits and are paid a small honorarium for participating in surveys. They are promised confidentiality of their responses. The research protocol is approved by the IRB responsible for NORC. In addition, all of the travel and living expenses for the delegates to A1R were paid by the project, plus a modest honorarium.

Using the panel as the probability sample source, we identified the delegates and controls in separate and independent processes to meet their respective requirements for targeted sample size. The control sample was selected first under a systematic stratified random sample design to ensure a balanced sample with respect to age, gender, race/ethnicity, educational attainment, political party identification, geography, and other dimensions. After the control sample was selected, the delegate sample was identified from the rest of the sample frame using the same sample stratification procedure. The independent samples were drawn to create representative treatment and control samples that correspond to U.S registered voter population benchmarks derived from the November 2018 Current Population Survey or the 2018 General Social Survey.

The treatment and control group samples were administered the same pre-event survey. All control group pre-event survey completions were retained for the post-event follow-up survey. All treatment group pre-event survey completions were potentially eligible for selection to the A1R event. NORC sub-sampled treatment group completions for selection to receive an invitation to participate in the A1R. The “final delegate” sample was selected from the pool of treatment pre-event survey completions who stated a willingness to be part of the event or were initially reluctant to participate but later changed their minds. To ensure that the final delegates who participate in A1R fully represent the diversity of the registered voting population, we set a sample size quota for key subpopulations defined by age, gender, race/ethnicity, geography, educational attainment, party identification, and LGBT status. NORC employed a “concierge” method, assigning a specific researcher to assist them with any travel or logistical issues related to their participation in the event. Additional funds were available to help respondents with special needs (compensation for child-care at home, companions who might assist those who lacked mobility, etc). The participants were informed that they were participating in a social science investigation of their opinions collected in confidential questionnaires.

The two surveys are designed to measure opinion and knowledge shifts that could occur in the time period elapsing between the administrations of the two surveys. The pre-event survey was administered to the treatment (n=2,741 completions) and control (1,101 completions) groups between July 9, 2019 and August 5, 2019 in English and Spanish. 1,566 participants in the treatment group were randomly selected within the relevant sub-populations to receive an invitation. 605 accepted and registered for the event. 560 booked travel (at the expense of the project) and 526 made the trip with 523 completing the final survey. The post-event survey was administered to the control group (n=844, 76.7% follow-up rate) between September 10 and September 20, 2019. The A1R delegates completed the post-event survey on September 22, 2019 at the event itself using a self-administered paper survey. Of the 526 delegates attending A1R, 523 completed the post-event survey (99.4% completion rate).

Participants’ individual privacy rights are maintained in all published and written data resulting from the study. Participant’s confidentiality is maintained through confidential questionnaires and recordings producing anonymized transcripts. All data collected is for research purposes only, anonymized, and stored on an encrypted and password protected device.

1. **Representativeness**

The following tables present data on the demographic representativeness of the treatment and control group samples compared to Census Benchmarks (A1), and the self-reported political party identification of the treatment and control groups (A2).

# Table A1 Treatment and Control Group Demographic Comparison to Census Benchmarks**[[1]](#footnote-1)**

**U.S. Registered Voters, Unweighted and Weighted (in %)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Treatment "Delegates" (n=523)** | **Control Group (n=844)** | **Population****Benchmark (Nov 2018 CPS)** |
| Unweighted | Weighted | Unweighted | Weighted |
| Gender |
| Male | 48.4 | 46.6 | 51.5 | 46.6 | 46.6 |
| Female | 51.6 | 53.4 | 48.5 | 53.4 | 53.4 |
| Age |
| 18 - 24 | 10.1 | 7.1 | 6.6 | 7.1 | 7.1 |
| 25 - 29 | 6.9 | 6.7 | 6.6 | 6.7 | 6.7 |
| 30 - 39 | 14.9 | 14.3 | 17.3 | 14.3 | 14.3 |
| 40 - 49 | 14.3 | 15.7 | 16.1 | 15.7 | 15.7 |
| 50 - 59 | 19.9 | 18.9 | 17.7 | 18.9 | 18.9 |
| 60 - 64 | 10.7 | 10.2 | 10.9 | 10.2 | 10.2 |
| 65 + | 23.1 | 27.1 | 24.8 | 27.1 | 27.1 |
| Race/Ethnicity |
| Non-Hispanic White | 63.9 | 72.8 | 71.8 | 72.8 | 72.8 |
| Non-Hispanic Black | 16.4 | 11.9 | 9.7 | 11.9 | 11.9 |
| Hispanic | 10.1 | 9.6 | 11.3 | 9.6 | 9.6 |
| All Other | 9.6 | 5.7 | 7.2 | 5.7 | 5.7 |
| Education Level |
| High School or Less | 9.8 | 26.9 | 20.5 | 26.9 | 26.9 |
| Some College | 39.0 | 29.7 | 34.7 | 29.7 | 29.7 |
| College Degree | 51.2 | 43.4 | 44.8 | 43.4 | 43.4 |
| Census Region |
| New England | 4.8 | 4.9 | 3.6 | 4.9 | 4.9 |
| Middle Atlantic | 9.0 | 12.5 | 12.1 | 12.5 | 12.5 |
| East North Central | 14.0 | 15.4 | 17.2 | 15.4 | 15.4 |
| West North Central | 8.6 | 7.2 | 6.4 | 7.2 | 7.2 |
| South Atlantic | 20.1 | 20.2 | 19.7 | 20.2 | 20.2 |
| East South Central | 5.7 | 5.9 | 3.8 | 5.9 | 5.9 |
| West South Central | 12.6 | 10.5 | 10.9 | 10.5 | 10.5 |
| Mountain | 6.9 | 7.7 | 8.4 | 7.7 | 7.7 |
| Pacific | 18.4 | 15.6 | 18.0 | 15.6 | 15.6 |
| Metro/Non-Metro |
| Non-Metro Areas | 12.2 | 13.6 | 12.1 | 13.6 | 13.6 |
| Metro Areas | 87.8 | 86.4 | 87.9 | 86.4 | 86.4 |

# Table A2: Self-Reported Party Identification for Treatment/Delegates and Controls (Unweighted)[[2]](#footnote-2)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Party ID | **Treatment "Delegates" (n=523)** | **Control Group (n=844)** |
| Democrat | 36.9 | 34.5 |
| Republican | 24.9 | 29.5 |
| Independent | 38.2 | 36.0 |

1. **Comparing Changes in Treatment and Control Group (Difference in Differences)**

Table A3 Comparison of Changes in Treatment and Control Group for Party Members

This table shows the mean opinion change difference in difference results for Democratic and Republican party members for the 26 items for which there was extreme polarization. The first column shows the mean opinion change among participants minus the mean change in the control group for Democrats. The second column shows the mean opinion change among participants minus the mean change in the control group for Republicans. The third column, “R-D” shows the change in the gap between Republicans and Democrats, time 2 minus time 1 (the difference in difference of means). The asterisks indicate the significance of the change. The “Overall Mean Difference” rows refer to the difference in means for the members of a given party overall. The “Most Polarized Mean Difference” refers to the difference in means for those members of a given party taking the strongest positions on the scale at Time 1. The asterisks indicate statistical significance with two-tailed tests as follows: \*p<.05; \*\*p<.01; \*\*\*p<.000; ns = not significant.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  | **POST-PRE (Delegate-Control)** |  |
|  |  | **Democrats** | **Republicans** | **Independents** | **R-D** |
| Q2A | [Reduce the number of refuges allowed to resettle the US.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference  | -0.813 | -1.897 | -1.613 | -1.084 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.404** | **-2.669** | **-0.805** | **-2.266** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q2C | [Provide aid to reduce poverty and violence in Central America.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.184 | 0.840 | 0.521 | 1.024 |
|  |  | ns | \*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  | **-0.092** | **1.240** | **0.231** | **1.332** |
|  |  | ns | \* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q2E | [Increase the number of visas for low-skilled workers to move to the US for industries that need them, like agriculture and service.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  |  Overall Mean D Difference  | 0.855 | 1.739 | 1.386 | 0.884 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  |  **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  | **0.330** | **2.468** | **1.208** | **2.139** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q2H | [Continue DACA, the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals program, which protects people who were brought to the US as children when their parents entered the country illegally.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.659 | 1.471 | 1.196 | 0.812 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.381** | **2.810** | **0.708** | **2.428** |
|  |  | \*\* | \*\*\* | \*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q2I | [Undocumented immigrants should be forced to return to their home countries before applying to legally come to the US to live and work permanently.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.886 | -2.721 | -1.939 | -1.835 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.315** | **-2.737** | **-1.746** | **-2.422** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q3A | [The US should commit to the 2014 Paris Agreement to combat climate change.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.067 | 0.859 | 0.239 | 0.792 |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.166** | **1.543** | **0.067** | **1.709** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q3B | [The US should go beyond the Paris Agreement and aim for more significant cutbacks on greenhouse gas emissions.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.091 | 0.705 | 0.202 | 0.614 |
|  |  | ns | \* | ns | \* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.190** | **1.104** | **0.179** | **1.295** |
|  |  | ns | \* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q3C | [The US should use taxes or other market incentives to achieve emissions reductions.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.100 | 1.082 | 0.455 | 1.182 |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.620** | **0.795** | **0.748** | **1.416** |
|  |  | \* | ns | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q3D | [A Green New Deal to commit to major investments in infrastructure and renewable energy.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.101 | -0.379 | -0.879 | -0.278 |
|  |  | ns | ns | \*\*\* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.780** | **0.349** | **-1.073** | **1.129** |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q3E | [The US should expand oil and gas production.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.391 | -0.330 | -0.225 | 0.061 |
|  |  | \* | ns | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.128** | **-0.164** | **-0.275** | **-0.036** |
|  |  | ns | ns | ns | \* |
| Q3H | [The US should mandate zero carbon emissions for cars, trucks, and buses.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -1.207 | -0.127 | -0.820 | 1.079 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-1.568** | **0.139** | **-0.631** | **1.706** |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4A | [Capital gains -- income earned when an investment that has increased in value is sold -- should be taxed the same as ordinary wage income.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.376 | -0.204 | 0.183 | -0.580 |
|  |  | ns | ns | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.500** | **0.398** | **-0.129** | **-0.102** |
|  |  | ns | ns | ns | \* |
| Q4B | [The US should impose a wealth tax on the richest taxpayers, requiring them to pay a small portion of their wealth on an annual basis.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.529 | -0.171 | -0.630 | 0.358 |
|  |  | \* | ns | \*\* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.445** | **0.817** | **-0.580** | **1.263** |
|  |  | ns | \* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4C | [The US should repeal the estate tax, which currently taxes deceased individuals worth at least $11 million and deceased couples worth at least $22 million.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.454 | -0.238 | -0.428 | -0.692 |
|  |  | ns | ns | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.294** | **-0.150** | **-0.610** | **-0.444** |
|  |  | ns | ns | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4F | [Lower the corporate tax rate from 21% to 15%.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -1.150 | -2.319 | -1.175 | -1.169 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.314** | **-2.244** | **-0.382** | **-1.929** |
|  |  | ns | \*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4G | [Increase federal minimum wage from $7.25/hr. to $15/hr.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -1.767 | -0.456 | -1.654 | 1.311 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-2.174** | **0.127** | **-1.510** | **2.301** |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q4H | [The government should cover the cost of college tuition at public universities for all students who could not otherwise afford it.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -1.050 | 0.023 | -0.630 | 1.073 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-1.242** | **0.733** | **-0.793** | **1.975** |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q4I | [The government should fund a bond for each child born that will accumulate in value until the child turns 18 to then become usable for higher education or other essentials for a start in life.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -3.184 | -1.110 | -2.893 | 2.074 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-4.235** | **-0.325** | **-2.787** | **3.910** |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q5A | [The Affordable Care Act should be repealed.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.069 | -1.578 | -0.936 | -1.509 |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.001** | **-1.961** | **-0.559** | **-1.962** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q5B | [Repeal the Affordable Care Act and replace with grants to state Governments to create their own systems.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.391 | -0.886 | -0.025 | -1.277 |
|  |  | ns | \*\* | ns | \* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.587** | **-1.261** | **-0.466** | **-1.848** |
|  |  | \* | ns | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q5C | [The federal subsidies in the Affordable Care Act that help the poor should be increased.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.032 | 1.149 | 0.679 | 1.117 |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-0.052** | **1.571** | **0.775** | **1.623** |
|  |  | ns | \*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q5D | [The federal subsidies in the Affordable Care Act that help the middle class should be expanded to include more people.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.335 | 1.212 | 0.764 | 0.876 |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  |  **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.286** | **2.554** | **0.548** | **2.268** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q5H | [People should be automatically enrolled in a more generous version of Medicare.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | -0.937 | -0.427 | -0.958 | 0.510 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **-1.090** | **0.074** | **-1.123** | **1.164** |
|  |  | \*\* | ns | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q6A | [The US should rejoin the Trans-Pacific Partnership, a trading agreement between 12 countries excluding China.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 1.071 | 2.122 | 1.564 | 1.050 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.373** | **4.757** | **1.180** | **4.384** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q6F | [The US should recommit to the Iran Nuclear Agreement.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.886 | 1.186 | 1.838 | 0.299 |
|  |  | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.577** | **1.804** | **1.755** | **1.228** |
|  |  | \* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q6G | [Presidents should be required to obtain explicit congressional approval for sending US troops into combat situations.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference | 0.088 | 1.126 | 0.195 | 1.037 |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference** | **0.039** | **2.426** | **0.201** | **2.387** |
|  |  | ns | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |

Table A4: Comparison of Changes in Treatment vs Control for Party Members Plus Leaners

This table shows the mean opinion change difference in difference results for party members plus leaners for the 26 items showing extreme partisan polarization. Democrats include “Lean Democrats” and Republicans include “Lean Republicans.” The first column shows the mean opinion change among participants minus the mean opinion change in the control group for Democrats (plus Leaners). The second column shows the mean opinion change among participants minus the mean change in the control group for Republicans (plus leaners). The third column, “R-D” shows the change in the gap between Republicans and Democrats, time 2 minus time 1 (difference in difference of means). The asterisks indicate the significance of the change. The “Overall Mean Difference” rows refer to the difference in means for the members of a given party (plus leaners) overall. The “Extreme Mean Difference” refers to the difference in means for those members of a given party (plus leaners) taking the most extreme positions at Time 1. The asterisks indicate statistical significance with two-tailed tests as follows: \*p<.05; \*\*p<.01; \*\*\*p<.000; ns = not significant.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  | **POST-PRE (Delegate-Control)** |  |
|  |  |  | **Democrats** | **Republicans** | **R-D** |
| Q2A | [Reduce the number of refuges allowed to resettle the US.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.891 | -2.004 | -1.112 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  |  **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.300** | **-2.472** | **-2.172** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q2C | [Provide aid to reduce poverty and violence in Central America.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.068 | 0.933 | 1.000 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.164** | **1.213** | **1.378** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q2E | [Increase the number of visas for low-skilled workers to move to the US for industries that need them, like agriculture and service.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.848 | 1.701 | 0.853 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.428** | **2.972** | **2.544** |
|  |   |   | \* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q2H | [Continue DACA, the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals program, which protects people who were brought to the US as children when their parents entered the country illegally.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.673 | 1.696 | 1.022 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.306** | **2.887** | **2.580** |
|  |   |   | \*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q2I | [Undocumented immigrants should be forced to return to their home countries before applying to legally come to the US to live and work permanently.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -1.022 | -2.681 | -1.660 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.588** | **-2.619** | **-2.031** |
|  |   |   | \* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q3A | [The US should commit to the 2014 Paris Agreement to combat climate change.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.137 | 0.750 | 0.613 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.164** | **1.171** | **1.334** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q3B | [The US should go beyond the Paris Agreement and aim for more significant cutbacks on greenhouse gas emissions.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.072 | 0.636 | 0.708 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.237** | **0.801** | **1.038** |
|  |   |   | ns | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q3C | [The US should use taxes or other market incentives to achieve emissions reductions.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.121 | 0.912 | 1.034 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.349** | **0.825** | **1.174** |
|  |   |   | ns | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q3D | [A Green New Deal to commit to major investments in infrastructure and renewable energy.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.362 | -0.471 | -0.110 |
|  |  |   | \* | \* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-1.058** | **0.243** | **1.301** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q3E | [The US should expand oil and gas production.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.269 | -0.409 | -0.140 |
|  |  |   | ns | \* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.065** | **-0.492** | **-0.427** |
|  |   |   | ns | ns | \*\* |
| Q3H | [The US should mandate zero carbon emissions for cars, trucks, and buses.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -1.159 | -0.175 | 0.984 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-1.400** | **0.003** | **1.402** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4A | [Capital gains -- income earned when an investment that has increased in value is sold -- should be taxed the same as ordinary wage income.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.409 | -0.193 | -0.603 |
|  |  |   | ns | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.133** | **0.361** | **0.227** |
|  |   |   | ns | ns | \*\* |
| Q4B | [The US should impose a wealth tax on the richest taxpayers, requiring them to pay a small portion of their wealth on an annual basis.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.803 | -0.112 | 0.690 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.899** | **0.814** | **1.712** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | \*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q4C | [The US should repeal the estate tax, which currently taxes deceased individuals worth at least $11 million and deceased couples worth at least $22 million.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.257 | -0.321 | -0.578 |
|  |  |   | ns | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.431** | **-0.650** | **-1.081** |
|  |   |   | ns | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4F | [Lower the corporate tax rate from 21% to 15%.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.872 | -2.201 | -1.329 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.222** | **-1.861** | **-1.638** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q4G | [Increase federal minimum wage from $7.25/hr. to $15/hr.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -1.897 | -0.584 | 1.313 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-2.388** | **0.154** | **2.542** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q4H | [The government should cover the cost of college tuition at public universities for all students who could not otherwise afford it.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -1.088 | 0.018 | 1.106 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | ns | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-1.441** | **0.509** | **1.950** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q4I | [The government should fund a bond for each child born that will accumulate in value until the child turns 18 to then become usable for higher education or other essentials for a start in life.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -3.342 | -1.348 | 1.995 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-4.523** | **-0.351** | **4.172** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q5A | [The Affordable Care Act should be repealed.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.144 | -1.479 | -1.335 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.014** | **-1.738** | **-1.724** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q5B | [Repeal the Affordable Care Act and replace with grants to state Governments to create their own systems.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.224 | -0.476 | -0.700 |
|  |  |   | ns | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.314** | **-1.006** | **-1.320** |
|  |   |   | ns | ns | \*\*\* |
| Q5C | [The federal subsidies in the Affordable Care Act that help the poor should be increased.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.137 | 1.081 | 0.944 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-0.136** | **1.501** | **1.637** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q5D | [The federal subsidies in the Affordable Care Act that help the middle class should be expanded to include more people.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.281 | 1.225 | 0.945 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.220** | **2.275** | **2.054** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q5H | [People should be automatically enrolled in a more generous version of Medicare.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | -0.991 | -0.432 | 0.558 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | ns | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **-1.311** | **0.678** | **1.988** |
|  |   |   | \*\*\* | \* | \*\*\* |
| Q6A | [The US should rejoin the Trans-Pacific Partnership, a trading agreement between 12 countries excluding China.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 1.158 | 2.001 | 0.843 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | \* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.603** | **3.281** | **2.678** |
|  |   |   | \*\* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q6F | [The US should recommit to the Iran Nuclear Agreement.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 1.062 | 1.324 | 0.263 |
|  |  |   | \*\*\* | \*\*\* | ns |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.550** | **1.742** | **1.192** |
|  |   |   | \* | \*\*\* | \*\*\* |
| Q6G | [Presidents should be required to obtain explicit congressional approval for sending US troops into combat situations.] How strongly would you oppose or favor these? |   |  |  |  |
|  | Overall Mean Difference |   | 0.012 | 0.794 | 0.783 |
|  |  |   | ns | \*\*\* | \*\* |
|  | **Most Polarized Mean Difference**  |  | **0.018** | **1.802** | **1.784** |
|  |   |   | ns | \*\* | \*\*\* |

1. **Moderator Evaluations and Knowledge Gains by Party**

Table A5 Participants’ Moderator Evaluations by Party ID and Overall

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |  |
|  | Overall | Democrats | Republicans | Independents |
| [My group moderator provided the opportunity for everyone to participate in the discussion]  | 4.78 | 4.72 | 4.82 | 4.79 |
| Disagree Strongly | 0.8 | 0.0 | 1.5 | 1.3 |
| Disagree Somewhat | 1.9 | 4.2 | 0.8 | 0.6 |
| Neither Agree nor Disagree | 1.9 | 1.0 | 3.0 | 2.5 |
| Agree Somewhat | 9.2 | 13.0 | 3.8 | 9.4 |
| Strongly Agree | 86.2 | 81.3 | 89.5 | 86.3 |
| DK/NA | 0.6 | 0.5 | 1.5 | 0.0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| [The members of my group participated relatively equally in the discussions]  | 3.8 | 3.7 | 4.0 | 3.8 |
| Disagree Strongly | 3.3 | 4.2 | 3.0 | 3.1 |
| Disagree Somewhat | 16.6 | 19.8 | 9.8 | 18.1 |
| Neither Agree nor Disagree | 5.6 | 6.3 | 5.3 | 5.6 |
| Agree Somewhat | 43.2 | 38.0 | 52.6 | 40.0 |
| Strongly Agree | 31.4 | 30.7 | 28.6 | 32.5 |
| DK/NA | 0.8 | 1.0 | 0.8 | 0.6 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| [My group moderator sometimes tried to influence the group with his or her own views]  | 1.2 | 1.2 | 1.1 | 1.2 |
| Disagree Strongly | 93.3 | 91.7 | 92.5 | 92.5 |
| Disagree Somewhat | 2.3 | 2.6 | 3.0 | 1.9 |
| Neither Agree nor Disagree | 1.5 | 1.0 | 1.5 | 2.5 |
| Agree Somewhat | 1.2 | 1.0 | 2.3 | 0.6 |
| Strongly Agree | 1.7 | 2.6 | 0.0 | 2.5 |
| DK/NA | 0.8 | 1.0 | 0.8 | 0.0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| [My group moderator tried to make sure that opposing argument were considered]  | 4.1 | 4.1 | 4.0 | 4.1 |
| Disagree Strongly | 6.7 | 4.2 | 9.8 | 6.9 |
| Disagree Somewhat | 3.3 | 4.2 | 2.3 | 3.8 |
| Neither Agree nor Disagree | 21.0 | 21.4 | 18.1 | 21.3 |
| Agree Somewhat | 14.8 | 15.1 | 15.8 | 13.1 |
| Strongly Agree | 54.2 | 54.7 | 52.6 | 55.0 |
| DK/NA | 0.6 | 0.5 | 1.5 | 0.0 |

Table A6 Knowledge Gains by Party

The individual question wordings and the knowledge gains are posted here:

<https://cdd.stanford.edu/mm/2019/10/A1R-Results-Knowledge-Oct2.pdf>

This table presents the results by party.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Knowledge Index** | **Participants (N=523)** |  | **Control (N=844)** |
|  | **T1** | **T2** | **T2-T1** | **Sig.** |  | **T1** | **T2** | **T2-T1** | **Sig.** |
| **Overall** | 45.8% | 60.1% | 14.3% | 0.000 |  | 42.0% | 43.2% | 1.2% | 0.082 |
| *By Party* |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| **Democrats** | 47.4% | 61.1% | 13.8% | 0.000 |  | 42.8% | 44.9% | 2.1% | 0.070 |
| **Republicans** | 43.2% | 59.1% | 15.9% | 0.000 |  | 38.7% | 40.4% | 1.7% | 0.193 |
| **Independents** | 48.7% | 60.6% | 11.9% | 0.000 |  | 46.5% | 46.8% | 0.3% | 0.855 |
| **None of these** | 37.3% | 56.6% | 19.2% | 0.000 |  | 36.5% | 35.5% | -1.0% | 0.635 |

Table A7: Depolarization Among Polarized and Non-Polarized Proposals

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **Republicans & Democrats become closer**  | **Republicans & Democrats become significantly closer** **(p** ≤ .05) |
| 26 Extremely Polarized Proposals |  | 23 | 18[[3]](#footnote-3) |
| 21 Non-PolarizedProposals |  | 18 | 5 |

1. Courtesy of NORC. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Courtesy of NORC [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Excludes one case where Republicans and Democrats moved to the same side. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)