

Setting the party agenda: Interest groups, voters and issue attention

Article published in the British Journal of Political Science

by

Heike Klüver

Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
heike.kluever@hu-berlin.de

Online Appendix

A Appendix

Table A.1: Descriptive statistics

Variable	N	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min	Max
Party issue attention (t_0)	363	5.920	6.127	0	36.332
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	363	4.594	4.084	0.065	15.833
Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	363	2.851	5.830	0	36.890
Government spending (t_{-1})	363	10.178	21.228	0	87.626
Party size	363	20.413	16.312	1.203	48.78842
Policy extremism	363	15.824	9.019	1.629	32.2357
Government party	363	0.424	0.495	0	1
Unemployment rate	363	10.406	1.839	7.2	13
Unification	363	0.879	0.327	0	1
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	363	5.910	5.485	0.182	25.192
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	363	5.910	6.154	0	36.332

Table A.2: Matching of CMP and Policy Agendas Categories

No	Issue Area	CMP Categories	Policy Agendas Categories
1	Welfare	503: Equality: Positive 504: Welfare State Expansion 505: Welfare State Limitation	300. General (Healthcare) 301. Comprehensive health care 302. Insurance reform, availability and cost 322. Facilities construction, regulation, and payments 323. Provider and insurer payment and regulation 325. Health manpower & Training 331. Prevention, communicable diseases and health promotion 332. Infants and children 333. Mental health and mental retardation 334. Long-term care, home health, terminally ill, and rehabilitation services 335. Prescription drug coverage and costs 336. Other or multiple benefits and procedures 341. Tobacco abuse and treatment 342. Alcohol abuse and treatment 343. Controlled and Illegal Drug Abuse, Treatment, and education 399. Other (Healthcare) 503. Employee benefits 506. Youth employment, youth job programs, child labour 508. Parental leave and child care 1300. Social welfare – general 1301. Food stamps, food assistance and nutrition monitoring programs 1302. Poverty and assistance for low-income families 1303. Elderly issues, elderly assistance programs 1304. Assistance to Disabled and Handicapped 1305. Social services and volunteer associations 1308. Social benefit related to children 1399. Other (Social Welfare) 1406. Low and Middle Income Housing Programs and Needs 1408. Elderly and handicapped housing 1409. Housing assistance for homeless and homeless issues 2504. Social welfare (Renification)
2	Decentralization	301: Decentralization 302: Centralization	1401. Housing and community development 1403. Urban economic development and general housing issues 1404. Rural housing and FmHA Housing assistance 1405. Rural economic development 2001. Intergovernmental Relations 24. State and local government administration

Table A.2: Matching of CMP and Policy Agendas Categories

No	Issue Area	CMP Categories	Policy Agendas Categories
3	Education	506: Education expansion 507: Education limitation	600. Education- general 601. Higher education 602. Elementary and Secondary education 603. Education of underprivileged students 604. Vocational education 606. Special education 607. Educational excellence 699. Other (Education)
4	Defence	105: Military Negative 104: Military Positive	1600. General – defence 1602. Defence alliances, security assistance 1603. Military intelligence, espionage 1604. Military readiness, coordination of armed services air support and sealift 1605. Arms control and nuclear non-proliferation 1606. Military aid and weapons sales to other countries 1608. Manpower, military personnel and dependents, military courts 1609. Veteran issues 1610. Military procurement 1611. Military installations, Construction, and Land 1612. National guard and reserve affairs 1614. Military nuclear and hazardous waste disposal 1615. Civil defence 1616. Civilian Personnel, Civilian employment, Military base closing 1617. Oversight of defense contracts and contractors 1619. Direct war related issues 1620. Relief of claims against the military 1698. Research and development (Defence) 1699. Other (Defence)
5	EU	108: EU Positive 110: EU Negative	1910. European Union and Common Market Issues
6	Immigration	602 National Way of Life: Negative 607: Multiculturalism Positive 601 National Way of Life: Positive 608: Multiculturalism Negative	201. Ethnic Minorities and Racial Group Discrimination 230. Immigration and Refugee Issues 529. Migrant and seasonal workers

Table A.2: Matching of CMP and Policy Agendas Categories

No	Issue Area	CMP Categories	Policy Agendas Categories
7	Environment	416: Anti-Growth Positive 501: Environmental Protection 410: Productivity	700. Environment: general 701. Drinking water quality 703. Waste Disposal 704. Hazardous Waste, Toxic Chemical Regulation, Treatment and Disposal 705. Air pollution, global warming, noise pollution 707. Recycling 708. Indoor environmental hazards 709. Species and Forest Protection 710. Coastal water pollution and preservation 711. Land and water conservation 798. Research and Development (Environment) 799. Other (Environment) 806. Alternative and renewable energy 807. Energy conservation
8	Agriculture	407: Protectionism Negative 406: Protectionism Positive 703: Agriculture and Farmers: Positive	400. General - Agriculture 401. Agricultural trade 402. Government subsidies to farmers; agricultural disaster insurance 403. Food inspection and safety 404. Agricultural marketing, research and promotion 405. Animal and Crop Disease and Pest Control 406. Animal welfare and treatment 407. Environmental problems of agricultural production 408. Fisheries and Fishing 498. Agricultural Research and Development 499. Other (Agriculture) 1802: Trade negotiations, disputes, agreements 1803. Export promotion and regulation, export-import bank 1807. Tariff and import restrictions, import regulation

Table A.2: Matching of CMP and Policy Agendas Categories

No	Issue Area	CMP Categories	Policy Agendas Categories
9	Civil rights	201: Freedom and Human Rights 202: Democracy 604: Traditional Morality: Negative 705: Underprivileged Minority Groups 706: Non-demographic Groups 603: Traditional Morality: Positive 605: Law and Order Positive	200. General – Civil Rights, Minority Issues, and Civil Liberties 202. Gender and Sexual Orientation 204. Age discrimination 205. Handicap or disease discrimination 206. Voting rights and issues 207. Freedom of speech & religion 208. Right to Privacy and Access to Government Information 209. Anti-Government Activities 210. Regulation of churches 299. Other (Civil rights) 1200. Law, crime, and family issues - general 1201. Law and crime agencies 1202. White collar crime and organized crime 1203. Illegal drug production, trafficking, control 1204. Court administration 1205. Prisons 1206. Juvenile crime and the juvenile justice system 1207. Child Abuse and Child Protection 1208. Family Issues 1209. Police, fire, weapons control 1210. Criminal and civil code 1211. Riots and crime prevention 1227. Domestic terrorism 1299. Other (Law, crime and family issues)
10	Culture	502: Culture: Positive	609. Arts and Humanities 1526. Sports and gambling regulation 2101. National parks, memorials, historic sites, and recreation 26. Media

Table A.2: Matching of CMP and Policy Agendas Categories

No	Issue Area	CMP Categories	Policy Agendas Categories
11	Technology and Infrastructure	411: Technology and Infrastructure: Positive	1000: General (Transportation) 1001: Mass transportation and safety 1002: Road construction, traffic and safety 1003: Airports, Airlines, Air Traffic Control and safety 1005: Railroad transportation and safety 1006: Truck and automobile transportation and safety 1007: Maritime issues and ship building 1010: Public works 1098: Research and development (Transportation) 1099: Other (Transportation) 1700: General (Space, Science, Technology and Communications) 1701: Government use of space, space exploration agreements 1704: Commercial use of space, satellites 1705: Science technology transfer, international scientific cooperation 1706: Telephone and telecommunication regulation 1707: Broadcast industry regulation 1709: Computer industry and computer security 1798: Research and development (Space, science, technology, communications) 1799: Other (Space, science, technology, communications)

Table A.3: Robustness Check based on issue attention by all voters

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 3	Model 4
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	0.142*** (0.049)	0.121** (0.048)
Voter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.036* (0.021)	-0.008 (0.014)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Voter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.020*** (0.007)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.004 (0.009)	-0.004 (0.009)
Policy extremism	-0.007 (0.017)	-0.006 (0.017)
Government party	0.141 (0.250)	0.158 (0.252)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.276*** (0.074)	0.265*** (0.071)
Unemployment rate	-0.153* (0.079)	-0.153* (0.079)
Government spending	-0.007 (0.014)	-0.036*** (0.013)
Unification	-1.038** (0.482)	-0.893* (0.461)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.611*** (0.069)	0.611*** (0.067)
Constant	2.605*** (0.960)	2.673*** (0.968)
Observations	418	418
R ²	0.79	0.80

Table A.4: Robustness Check based on current interest group mobilization

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 5	Model 6
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_0)	0.144*** (0.046)	0.129** (0.049)
Party supporter issue attention (t_0)	0.237*** (0.068)	0.098* (0.058)
Interest group mobilization (t_0) * Party supporter issue attention (t_0)		0.038*** (0.010)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.012 (0.009)	-0.010 (0.009)
Policy extremism	-0.001 (0.019)	-0.001 (0.019)
Government party	0.299 (0.262)	0.279 (0.279)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.302*** (0.075)	0.312*** (0.073)
Government spending	-0.017 (0.014)	-0.045*** (0.015)
Unemployment rate	-0.169 (0.110)	-0.177 (0.110)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.545*** (0.068)	0.524*** (0.067)
Constant	1.831 (1.183)	2.144* (1.192)
Observations	319	319
R ²	0.79	0.79

Table A.5: Robustness Check based on average interest group mobilization during the last legislative term

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 7	Model 8
Explanatory variables		
Average interest group mobilization (past term)	0.135*** (0.046)	0.127*** (0.046)
Average party supporter issue attention (past term)	0.029 (0.024)	0.002 (0.023)
Avg. interest group mobilization * Avg. party supporter issue attention		0.011 (0.007)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.004 (0.009)	-0.004 (0.009)
Policy extremism	-0.007 (0.017)	-0.007 (0.017)
Government party	0.141 (0.250)	0.147 (0.251)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.276*** (0.075)	0.269*** (0.075)
Government spending	-0.005 (0.014)	-0.021 (0.016)
Unemployment rate	-0.160** (0.078)	-0.146* (0.080)
Unification	-1.005** (0.487)	-1.004** (0.485)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.611*** (0.070)	0.611*** (0.070)
Constant	2.693*** (0.993)	2.664** (1.003)
Observations	418	418
R ²	0.79	0.79

Table A.6: Robustness Check based on two lags of voter issue attention

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 9	Model 10
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	0.100** (0.043)	0.108** (0.050)
Voter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.058 (0.049)	-0.033 (0.039)
Voter issue attention (t_{-2})	-0.041 (0.049)	0.037 (0.032)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Voter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.031*** (0.010)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Voter issue attention (t_{-2})		-0.018 (0.013)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.010 (0.008)	-0.011 (0.009)
Policy extremism	-0.005 (0.017)	0.001 (0.019)
Government party	0.207 (0.270)	0.289 (0.304)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.269*** (0.077)	0.332*** (0.080)
Government spending	0.000 (0.014)	-0.020 (0.024)
Unemployment rate	-0.163** (0.077)	-0.264** (0.109)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.617*** (0.070)	0.540*** (0.066)
Constant	1.900** (0.870)	3.002** (1.153)
Observations	374	319
R^2	0.80	0.79

Table A.7: Robustness Check based with fixed effects for parties

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 11	Model 12
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	0.159*** (0.054)	0.140** (0.055)
Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.064** (0.028)	0.004 (0.021)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.020*** (0.007)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.061 (0.050)	-0.061 (0.049)
Policy extremism	-0.032 (0.025)	-0.027 (0.025)
Government party	0.306 (0.264)	0.307 (0.274)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.318*** (0.073)	0.322*** (0.072)
Government spending	-0.013 (0.015)	-0.038** (0.016)
Unemployment rate	-0.195* (0.115)	-0.216* (0.114)
Unification	-1.089** (0.537)	-0.966* (0.537)
The Left	0.573 (0.624)	0.456 (0.605)
SPD	1.472 (1.391)	1.451 (1.341)
FDP	-0.517 (0.502)	-0.484 (0.505)
CDU/CSU	1.961 (1.543)	1.929 (1.529)
Constant	3.857** (1.542)	4.125*** (1.514)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.560*** (0.066)	0.548*** (0.065)
Observations	363	363
R ²	0.78	0.78

Table A.8: Robustness Check with fixed effects for elections

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 13	Model 14
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})		
	0.156*** (0.053)	0.139** (0.054)
Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.062** (0.028)	-0.002 (0.023)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.021*** (0.007)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.005 (0.009)	-0.005 (0.010)
Policy extremism	0.001 (0.021)	-0.000 (0.020)
Government party	0.236 (0.251)	0.222 (0.271)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.322*** (0.072)	0.323*** (0.072)
Government spending	-0.013 (0.015)	-0.039** (0.017)
Unemployment rate	-0.231** (0.115)	-0.199* (0.114)
Unification	-0.590 (0.482)	-0.760 (0.496)
1990	-0.741 (0.525)	-0.240 (0.520)
1994	-0.145 (0.412)	0.241 (0.451)
1998	-0.610 (0.561)	-0.469 (0.564)
2002	-0.059 (0.390)	0.113 (0.366)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.560*** (0.066)	0.548*** (0.066)
Constant	3.083** (1.164)	2.982** (1.161)
Observations	363	363
R ²	0.78	0.78

Table A.9: Robustness Check without party-specific controls

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 15	Model 16
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})		
	0.161*** (0.054)	0.141** (0.054)
Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.063** (0.028)	0.001 (0.022)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.021*** (0.007)
Control variables		
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.316*** (0.075)	0.321*** (0.073)
Unemployment rate	-0.180 (0.112)	-0.202* (0.112)
Government spending	-0.013 (0.015)	-0.039** (0.016)
Unification	-0.907* (0.497)	-0.793 (0.502)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.560*** (0.069)	0.548*** (0.067)
Constant	2.630** (1.086)	2.988*** (1.085)
Observations	363	363
R ²	0.78	0.78

Table A.10: Robustness Check with interaction effects for party supporter issue attention

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 17	Model 18
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	0.161*** (0.055)	0.140** (0.055)
Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.002 (0.071)	-0.074 (0.076)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.022*** (0.006)
Control variables		
Party size	-0.011 (0.010)	-0.011 (0.010)
Policy extremism	-0.015 (0.018)	-0.014 (0.018)
Government party	0.526* (0.288)	0.537* (0.283)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.333*** (0.072)	0.338*** (0.072)
Unemployment rate	-0.175 (0.115)	-0.200* (0.115)
Government spending	-0.013 (0.015)	-0.040** (0.016)
Unification	-0.932* (0.507)	-0.813 (0.512)
Party size * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.001 (0.002)	0.001 (0.002)
Government party * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	-0.098 (0.059)	-0.096* (0.055)
Policy extremism * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.005 (0.004)	0.005 (0.004)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.545*** (0.066)	0.532*** (0.065)
Constant	2.854** (1.196)	3.229*** (1.207)
Observations	363	363
R ²	0.78	0.79

Table A.11: Robustness Check with interaction effects for interest group mobilization

DV: Party issue attention (t_0)	Model 19	Model 20
Explanatory variables		
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	0.271* (0.139)	0.250* (0.133)
Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})	0.062** (0.029)	-0.000 (0.023)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1}) * Party supporter issue attention (t_{-1})		0.021*** (0.007)
Control variables		
Party size	0.007 (0.012)	0.008 (0.011)
Policy extremism	0.001 (0.028)	0.002 (0.027)
Government party	0.632* (0.357)	0.633 (0.400)
Party system issue attention (t_{-1})	0.324*** (0.073)	0.328*** (0.074)
Unemployment rate	-0.180 (0.117)	-0.204* (0.116)
Government spending	-0.013 (0.015)	-0.039** (0.015)
Unification	-0.911* (0.502)	-0.796 (0.507)
Party size * Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	-0.003 (0.003)	-0.003 (0.003)
Government party * Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	-0.092 (0.066)	-0.090 (0.084)
Policy extremism * Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	-0.001 (0.006)	-0.001 (0.006)
Party issue attention (t_{-1})	0.552*** (0.066)	0.540*** (0.066)
Constant	2.207* (1.206)	2.545** (1.202)
Observations	363	363
R ²	0.78	0.78

Table A.12: Regression analysis exploring the relationship between interest group mobilization and government spending

	Model 21: DV Interest group mobilization (t_0)	Model 22: DV Government spending (t_0)
Interest group mobilization (t_{-1})	1.005*** (0.002)	0.017 (0.017)
Government spending (t_{-1})	-0.001 (0.000)	0.992*** (0.004)
Constant	0.011 (0.009)	-0.284*** (0.069)
Observations	451	374