Appendix Table 1: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Salience Controls*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.03(0.02) |  |  |  | -0.03(0.02) |  | 0.13\*\*(0.07) |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.10(0.07) | -0.07(0.10) |  |
| Right | 0.01(0.02) |  |  |  | 0.01(0.02) | -0.07(0.05) |  |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.02\*\*(0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.01\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.02(0.02) | -0.02(0.02) | 0.03\*(0.02) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.01(0.02) | -0.01(0.02) | 0.00(0.02) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.08\*(0.04) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.07\*\*(0.03) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.11\*\*(0.04) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.03(0.06) |  |
| Radical Right in Gov’t |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.11\*(0.06) |
| Far Left/ Green in Gov’t  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.04\*(0.02) |
| Salience | 0.01\*\*(0.00) | 0.01\*\*(0.00) | 0.01\*(0.00) | 0.01\*\*(0.00) | 0.01\*(0.00) | 0.01\*(0.00) | 0.01\*(0.00) | 0.01\*(0.00) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) |
| Constant | -0.01(0.03) | -0.11\*\*\*(0.04) | -0.01(0.02) | -0.03(0.02) | -0.03(0.04) | 0.01(0.04) | -0.06(0.04) | -0.02(0.02) |
| Observations | 638 | 635 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| N\_clust | 191.00 | 190.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 | 191.00 |
| r2 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.05 | 0.04 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01Appendix Table 2: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Control for Left-Right Cabinet Score*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.02\*\*(0.01) | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) | -0.01(0.02) | -0.02(0.02) |
| Radical Right Vote |  | 0.00\*\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  | -0.01\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  | 0.03\*(0.02) | -0.05(0.04) | 0.03\*\*(0.02) |
| ENLP |  |  |  | -0.01(0.02) | -0.01(0.02) | -0.15\*(0.08) |
| ENRP x Left-Right Cabinet Score |  |  |  |  | 0.02\*(0.01) |  |
| ENLP x Left-Right Cabinet Score |  |  |  |  |  | 0.02\*(0.01) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.00(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.02(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) |
| Constant | -0.08\*\*(0.04) | -0.07\*\*(0.03) | -0.08\*\*(0.04) | -0.14\*\*\*(0.05) | 0.01(0.09) | 0.09(0.12) |
| Observations | 635 | 635 | 635 | 635 | 635 | 635 |
| N\_clust | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 | 190.00 |
| r2 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.03 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.03 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix Table 3: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Control for Kayser and Lindstädt’s (2015) Loss Probabilities (LPR and LPR2*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 |  3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.03(0.03) |  |  |  | -0.02(0.03) |  | 0.15\*\*(0.06) |  |
| Right | 0.01(0.03) |  |  |  | 0.01(0.02) | -0.15\*\*(0.06) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.18\*\*(0.08) | -0.14(0.12) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.02\*\*(0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.01\*\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | 0.00(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.01(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.05\*\*(0.02) | -0.01(0.02) | 0.06\*\*\*(0.02) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | 0.01(0.03) | 0.00(0.03) | 0.01(0.02) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.12\*\*(0.05) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.11\*\*\*(0.04) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.12\*\*\*(0.03) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.07(0.07) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.19\*\*(0.07) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.01(0.02) |
| LPR | -0.10(0.18) | -0.14(0.16) | -0.07(0.16) | -0.08(0.17) | 0.03(0.18) | -0.04(0.17) | 0.09(0.18) | -0.16(0.15) |
| LPRsq | 0.16(0.32) | 0.22(0.29) | 0.12(0.30) | 0.13(0.31) | -0.00(0.31) | 0.09(0.29) | -0.06(0.30) | 0.25(0.27) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.02(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) |
| Constant | 0.02(0.04) | -0.08\*(0.04) | 0.01(0.03) | 0.00(0.03) | -0.09(0.06) | 0.01(0.05) | -0.13\*\*\*(0.05) | 0.01(0.03) |
| Observations | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 | 513 |
| Clusters | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 | 149.00 |
| *R*2 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.03 | 0.01 | 0.03 | 0.06 | 0.05 | 0.04 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix Table 4: Estimated Effects on Net Number of Citizenship Policy Changes (OLS)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.12\*(0.07) |  |  |  | -0.14\*(0.07) |  | 0.41\*(0.22) |  |
| Right | 0.05(0.08) |  |  |  | 0.05(0.07) | -0.21(0.20) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.21(0.19) | -0.19(0.32) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.07\*\*\*(0.02) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.01\*\*(0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | -0.00(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.03\*\*(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.09(0.06) | -0.02(0.04) | 0.12\*\*(0.06) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.04(0.08) | -0.05(0.08) | 0.01(0.07) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.20\*(0.11) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.24\*(0.13) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.37\*\*\*(0.14) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.07(0.18) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.55\*\*(0.23) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.20\*\*(0.09) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.00(0.03) | 0.01(0.03) | -0.02(0.03) | 0.02(0.03) | 0.01(0.03) | -0.00(0.03) | 0.01(0.03) | -0.00(0.03) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) |
| Liberal | 0.08(0.07) | 0.07(0.07) | 0.14\*(0.07) | 0.10(0.07) | 0.09(0.07) | 0.09(0.07) | 0.10(0.07) | 0.12\*(0.07) |
| Constant | 0.11(0.08) | -0.30\*\*(0.12) | 0.08(0.09) | 0.05(0.06) | 0.02(0.13) | 0.11(0.13) | -0.09(0.14) | 0.07(0.07) |
| Observations | 638 | 635 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| Clusters | 191 | 190 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 |
| *R*2 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.04 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix Table 5: Estimated Effects on Net Weighted Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | -0.03(0.03) |  |  |  | -0.04(0.04) |  | 0.25\*\*\*(0.09) |  |
| Right | 0.03(0.03) |  |  |  | 0.03(0.03) | -0.14\*(0.08) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.17\*(0.10) | -0.06(0.09) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.00\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | 0.00(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.01\*(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.05\*\*(0.02) | -0.02(0.02) | 0.06\*\*\*(0.02) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.03(0.03) | -0.04(0.03) | 0.00(0.02) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.12\*\*(0.05) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.12\*\*\*(0.04) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.20\*\*\*(0.06) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.01(0.05) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.17\*\*\*(0.06) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.03(0.03) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | -0.00(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) | -0.02(0.02) | 0.00(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.04(0.03) | 0.04(0.02) | 0.06\*\*(0.03) | 0.05\*(0.03) | 0.05\*(0.03) | 0.05\*(0.02) | 0.05\*\*(0.02) | 0.06\*\*(0.02) |
| Constant | 0.01(0.03) | -0.13\*\*(0.05) | 0.03(0.04) | -0.01(0.03) | -0.01(0.06) | 0.07(0.06) | -0.08(0.06) | -0.01(0.03) |
| Observations | 638 | 635 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| Clusters | 191 | 190 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 |
| *R*2 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.04 | 0.04 | 0.02 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix 6: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Controls for Ortega and Peri’s (2013) Immigration Policy Scores*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 |
| Left | 0.06(0.04) |  |  |  | 0.03(0.04) |  | 0.26(0.17) |  |
| Right | 0.05(0.04) |  |  |  | 0.05(0.04) | -0.26\*\*\*(0.08) |  |  |
| Center |  |  |  |  |  | -0.26\*\*(0.11) | -0.33(0.27) |  |
| Left-Right Cabinet Score |  | 0.01(0.01) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  |  | 0.01\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  |  | 0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Radical Right Vote |  |  |  | 0.01(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| Change, Far Left/ Green Vote |  |  |  | -0.00(0.01) |  |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  |  |  | 0.07\*\*(0.03) | 0.00(0.02) | 0.07\*\*(0.03) |  |
| ENLP |  |  |  |  | 0.00(0.07) | -0.04(0.07) | 0.07(0.06) |  |
| Center x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.14\*\*(0.06) |  |  |
| Right x ENRP |  |  |  |  |  | 0.16\*\*\*(0.05) |  |  |
| Left x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | -0.19(0.13) |  |
| Center x ENLP |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.19(0.17) |  |
| Far Right in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.36\*\*\*(0.12) |
| Far Left/Green in Gov't |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.06(0.06) |
| Immigration Policy (Entry) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.00(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) |
| Immigration Policy (Residence) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | -0.00(0.02) | -0.02(0.02) | -0.00(0.02) | 0.01(0.01) |
| Immigration Policy (Asylum) | -0.01(0.02) | -0.00(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.00(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.01) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | -0.02(0.02) | -0.01(0.02) | -0.02(0.02) | -0.02(0.03) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.01(0.02) | 0.02(0.02) | -0.04\*(0.02) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) | -0.00(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) |
| Liberal | 0.05(0.04) | 0.05(0.04) | 0.04(0.04) | 0.05(0.04) | 0.06\*(0.03) | 0.08\*\*(0.03) | 0.07\*\*(0.03) | 0.06(0.04) |
| Constant | -0.00(0.05) | -0.02(0.06) | -0.01(0.06) | 0.04(0.05) | -0.17(0.11) | 0.05(0.09) | -0.22\*\*(0.11) | 0.05(0.04) |
| Observations | 204 | 202 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 | 204 |
| Clusters | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 | 65 |
| *R*2 | 0.04 | 0.03 | 0.06 | 0.04 | 0.06 | 0.12 | 0.08 | 0.10 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01Appendix Table 7: Estimated Effects on Net Citizenship Policy Change (OLS)

(*With Controls for Liberal Party Variables*)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Liberal Party Vote Share | 0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Vote |  | 0.00\*\*\*(0.00) |  |  |  |
| Far Left/Green Vote |  | -0.00(0.00) |  |  |  |
| Liberal Party in Gov't |  |  | 0.01(0.02) | -0.11\*\*(0.06) | 0.09(0.06) |
| ENRP |  |  |  | -0.00(0.01) | 0.02(0.02) |
| ENLP |  |  |  | 0.00(0.02) | 0.01(0.03) |
| Liberal Party in Gov't x ENRP |  |  |  | 0.07\*\*(0.03) |  |
| Liberal Party in Gov't x ENLP |  |  |  |  | -0.05(0.03) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.00(0.01) | -0.01(0.01) | 0.00(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) | 0.01(0.01) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) | 0.00(0.00) |
| GDP Growth | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) | -0.00(0.00) |
| Liberal | 0.03(0.02) | 0.03\*(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) | 0.03(0.02) |
| Constant | 0.01(0.02) | 0.02(0.03) | 0.00(0.02) | -0.01(0.04) | -0.06(0.04) |
| Observations | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |
| Clusters | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 | 191 |
| *R*2 | 0.00 | 0.01 | 0.00 | 0.02 | 0.01 |

Standard errors in parentheses

\* p<.1, \*\* p<.05, \*\*\* p<.01

Appendix 8: Estimated Effects of Party Competition on Liberalizations and Restrictions (Logistic Regression)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Restrictions* | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | *Liberalizations* | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Right Party Vote | 0.99(0.01) |  |  |  |  | Left Party Vote | 1.06\*\*(0.03) |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Party Vote | 1.07\*\*\*(0.02) |  |  |  | 1.05\*(0.03) | Far Left/Green Party Vote | 1.03(0.03) |  |  |  | 1.02(0.04) |
| Right Gov’t |  |  | 1.28(0.36) | 0.38(0.29) | 0.70(0.27) | Left Gov’t |  |  | 2.54\*(1.27) | 0.05\*\*(0.06) | 1.33(1.04) |
| Radical Right in Gov’t |  | 3.66\*\*\*(1.58) |  |  |  | Far Left/Green in Gov't |  | 3.00\*\*(1.50) |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  | 1.55\*\*(0.30) | 1.21(0.30) |  | ENLP |  |  | 1.73(0.63) | 0.64(0.31) |  |
| Right Gov’t x ENRP |  |  |  | 1.94(0.78) |  | Left Gov’t x ENLP |  |  |  | 8.65\*\*\*(5.69) |  |
| Right Gov’t x Radical Right Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.10\*\*(0.04) | Left Gov’t x Far Left/Green Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.05(0.06) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 1.12(0.24) | 1.39(0.31) | 1.47\*(0.32) | 1.43(0.32) | 1.12(0.25) | Foreign Born Percent (log) | 1.62\*\*(0.39) | 1.48\*(0.34) | 1.55\*(0.36) | 1.50\*(0.34) | 1.67\*(0.48) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.97(0.03) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.97(0.03) | Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.94\*(0.03) | 0.94\*\*(0.03) | 0.94\*\*(0.03) | 0.94\*(0.03) | 0.94(0.05) |
| Liberal | 1.95\*\*(0.61) | 1.55(0.46) | 1.35(0.40) | 1.35(0.40) | 1.80\*(0.56) | Liberal | 0.47(0.29) | 0.39(0.24) | 0.35\*(0.21) | 0.31\*\*(0.18) | 0.39\*(0.21) |
| Constant  | 0.07\*\*\*(0.04) | 0.05\*\*\*(0.02) | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.03\*\*\*(0.02) | 0.05\*\*\*(0.02) | Constant | 0.00\*\*\*(0.00) | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.01\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.05\*\*\*(0.05) | 0.01\*\*\*(0.01) |
| Chi2 | 20.63 | 14.82 | 9.95 | 13.45 | 27.24 |  | 15.54 | 17.46 | 10.12 | 27.97 | 12.39 |
| Observations | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |  | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |

Exponentiated coefficients; Standard errors in parentheses. \* p<0.10, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01

Appendix 9: Estimated Effects of Party Competition on Liberalizations and Restrictions (Rare Events Logistic Regression), with Salience Control

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Restrictions* | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | *Liberalizations* | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
| Right Party Vote | 1.00(0.01) |  |  |  |  | Left Party Vote | 1.06\*\*(0.03) |  |  |  |  |
| Radical Right Party Vote | 1.06\*\*(0.02) |  |  |  | 1.03(0.03) | Far Left/Green Party Vote | 1.03(0.03) |  |  |  | 1.03(0.04) |
| Right Gov’t |  |  | 1.24(0.35) | 0.41(0.33) | 0.77(0.30) | Left Gov’t |  |  | 2.46\*\*(0.99) | 0.07\*(0.09) | 1.33(1.02) |
| Radical Right in Gov’t |  | 1.85(0.90) |  |  |  | Far Left/Green in Gov't |  | 3.28\*\*(1.55) |  |  |  |
| ENRP |  |  | 1.24(0.26) | 1.01(0.26) |  | ENLP |  |  | 1.77(0.65) | 0.73(0.42) |  |
| Right Gov’t x ENRP |  |  |  | 1.83(0.74) |  | Left Gov’t x ENLP |  |  |  | 7.32\*\*\*(5.65) |  |
| Right Gov’t x Radical Right Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.08\*(0.04) | Left Gov’t x Far Left/Green Vote |  |  |  |  | 1.05(0.06) |
| Salience  | 1.12\*\*\*(0.05) | 1.14\*\*\*(0.05) | 1.15\*\*\*(0.04) | 1.14\*\*\*(0.04) | 1.11\*\*(0.04) | Salience | 1.03(0.07) | 0.96(0.06) | 0.99(0.06) | 0.99(0.06) | 1.00(0.06) |
| Foreign Born Percent (log) | 0.97(0.22) | 1.14(0.25) | 1.14(0.25) | 1.13(0.25) | 1.01(0.23) | Foreign Born Percent (log) | 1.53(0.45) | 1.53(0.42) | 1.54(0.43) | 1.48(0.41) | 1.62\*(0.47) |
| Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.98(0.03) | 0.97(0.03) | Migration Rate (lagged) | 0.95(0.05) | 0.94(0.05) | 0.94(0.05) | 0.94(0.05) | 0.94(0.05) |
| Liberal | 1.55(0.49) | 1.30(0.39) | 1.21(0.36) | 1.21(0.36) | 1.54(0.48) | Liberal | 0.51(0.26) | 0.44(0.23) | 0.39\*(0.20) | 0.35\*(0.19) | 0.44(0.22) |
| Constant  | 0.03\*\*\*(0.02) | 0.03\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.02\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.03\*\*\*(0.02) | 0.04\*\*\*(0.02) | Constant | 0.00\*\*\*(0.00) | 0.03\*\*\*(0.02) | 0.01\*\*\*(0.01) | 0.05\*\*\*(0.06) | 0.01\*\*\*(0.01) |
| Chi2 | 28.44 | 24.87 | 24.31 | 26.41 | 34.20 |  | 8.73 | 10.56 | 9.75 | 19.12 | 11.84 |
| Observations | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |  | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 | 638 |

Exponentiated coefficients; Standard errors in parentheses. \* p<0.10, \*\* p<0.05, \*\*\* p<0.01