Data supplement to Tajika et al. Replication and contradiction of highly cited research papers in psychiatry: 10-year follow-up. Br J Psychiatry doi: 10.1192/bjp.bp.113.143701

 Table DS1
 Details of included studies

	ar Title Journal Design Intervention Control					New	er Studies		Previous	Studies		Newer Studies		
No. of 3-Year Citations	Title	Journal	Design			Title	Intervention (Sample Size)	Control (Sample Size)	Outcome	SMD	Outcome	SMD	95% CI	Comparison
164	Keller 2000 A comparison of nefazodone, the cognitive behavioral-analysis system of psychotherapy, and their combination for the treatment of chronic depression	N Engl J Med	RCT	Nefazodone + Psychotherapy (227)	Nefazodone (226) Psychotherapy (228)									Unchallenged
164	Zandi 2002 Hormone replacement therapy and incidence of Alzheimer disease in older women - The Cache County Study	JAMA	Cohort	Hormone Replacement Therapy (1066)	No use (800)									Unchallenged
164	In't Veld 2001 Nonsteroidal antiinflammatory drugs and the risk of Alzheimer's disease	N Engl J Med	Cohort	NSAIDs long-term use (233)	No use (2553)	Breitner 2011 Extended results of the Alzheimer's disease anti-inflammatory prevention trial	NSAIDs (1445)	Placebo (1083)	Development of Alzheimer's Disease	0.93	Development of Alzheimer's Disease	0.02	-0.06 to 0.10	Contradicted
160	Unutzer 2002 Collaborative care management of late-life depression in the primary care setting - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	The Improving Mood-Promoting Access to Collaborative Treatment program (889)	Usual care (870)	Patel 2010 Effectiveness of an intervention led by lay health counsellors for depressive and anxiety disorders in primary care in Goa, India (MANAS): a cluster randomised controlled trial	Stepped-care	Usual Care (1436)	Response (SCL-20)	0.68	Recovery (ICD-10)	0.06	-0.10 to 0.22	Contradicted
158	McKeith 2000 Efficacy of rivastigmine in dementia with Lewy bodies: a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled international study	Lancet	RCT	Rivastigmine (59)	Placebo (61)	Emre 2004 Rivastigmine for dementia associated with Parkinson's disease	Rivastigmine (362)	Placebo (179)	NPI-4	0.22	NPI-10	0.16	-0.03 to 0.35	Replicated
142	Erkinjuntti 2002 Efficacy of galantamine in probable vascular dementia and Alzheimer's disease combined with cerebrovascular disease: a randomised trial	Lancet	RCT	Galantamine (396)	Placebo (196)	Auchus 2007 Galantamine treatment of vascular dementia: a randomized trial	Galantamine (396)	Placebo (390)	ADAS-cog/11	0.35	ADAS-cog/11	0.33	0.18 to 0.48	Replicated
140	McCracken 2002 Risperidone in children with autism and serious behavioral problems	N Engl J Med	RCT	Risperidone (49)	Placebo (52)									Unchallenged
138	Csernansky 2002 A comparison of risperidone and haloperidol for the prevention of relapse in patients with schizophrenia	N Engl J Med	RCT	Risperidone (177)	Haloperidol (188)	Schooler 2005 Risperidone and haloperidol in first-episode psychosis: a long-term randomized trial	Risperidone (278)	Haloperidol (277)	Relapse	0.89	Relapse	0.29	0.09 to 0.49	Initially Stronger
133	Musselman 2001 Paroxetine for the prevention of depression induced by high-dose interferon alfa	N Engl J Med	RCT	Paroxetine (20)	Placebo (20)	Raison 2007 Paroxetine for prevention of depressive symptoms induced by interferon-alpha and ribavirin for hepatitis C	Paroxetine (28)	Placebo (33)	Development of Depression	1.05	Development of Depression	0.31	-0.24 to 0.86	Initially Stronger
129	Tohen 2000 Efficacy of olanzapine in acute bipolar mania ⁻ A double-blind, placebo-controlled study	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Olanzapine (55)	Placebo (60)	McIntyre 2009 A 3-week, randomized, placebo-controlled trial of asenapine in the treatment of acute mania in bipolar mania and mixed states	Olanzapine (190)	Placebo (104)	YMRS	0.99	YMRS	1.19	0.93 to 1.45	Replicated
124	Street 2000 Olanzapine treatment of psychotic and behavioral symptoms in patients with Alzheimer disease in nursing care facilities - A double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled trial	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Olanzapine 5mg (56) + Olanzapine 10mg (50)	Placebo (47)	De Deyn 2004 Olanzapine versus placebo in the treatment of psychosis with or without associated behavioral disturbances in patients with Alzheimer's disease	Olanzapine 5mg (125) + Olanzapine 7.5mg (132)	Placebo (129)	Core Total of NPI/NH	0.41	Core Total of NPI/NH	0.04	-0.17 to 0.25	Initially Stronger
121	Bilder 2002 Neurocognitive effects of clozapine, olanzapine, risperidone, and haloperidol in patients with chronic schizophrenia or schizoaffective disorder	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Risperidone (26) + Olanzapine (26)	Haloperidol (25)	Jerrell 2008 Changes in neuropsychological functioning following treatment with risperidone, olanzapine, and conventional antipsychotic medications	Risperidone (36) + Olanzapine (30)	Conventional (42)	Neurocognitive Global Score	0.55	F, A, S Total Score	0.55	0.16 to 0.94	Replicated

112	Purdon 2000 Neuropsychological change in early phase schizophrenia during 12 months of treatment with olanzapine, risperidone, or haloperidol	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Olanzapine (21)	Haloperidol (23) Risperidone (21)	Keefe 2006 One-year double-blind study of the neurocognitive efficacy of olanzapine, risperidone, and haloperidol in schizophrenia	Olanzapine (159)	Haloperidol (97) Risperidone (158)	The General Cognitive Index	OZP vs. HPD 0.91 OZP vs. RIS 0.50	Neurocognitive Composite Score	OZP vs. HPD 0.10 OZP vs. RIS 0.03	-0.18 to 0.38 -0.21 to 0.27	Initially Stronger
112	Sackeim 2000 A prospective, randomized, double-blind comparison of bilateral and right unilateral electroconvulsive therapy at different stimulus intensities	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	High-Dosage Right Unilateral ECT (20)	High-Dosage Bilateral ECT (20)									Unchallenged
102	Wilson 2002 Participation in cognitively stimulating activities and risk of incident Alzheimer disease	JAMA	Cohort	High cognitive activities	Low cognitive activities (Total Sample Size 801)									Unchallenged
100	Sachs 2002 Combination of a mood stabilizer with risperidone or haloperidol for treatment of acute mania: A double-blind, placebo-controlled comparison of efficacy and safety	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Risperidone + Mood Stabilizer (52)	Placebo + Mood Stabilizer (51)	Yatham 2003 Mood stabilisers plus risperidone or placebo in the treatment of acute mania. International, double-blind, randomised controlled trial	Risperidone + Mood Stabilizer (75)	Placebo + Mood Stabilizer (75)	YMRS	0.61	YMRS	0.95	0.56 to 1.34	Replicated
99	Volavka 2002 Clozapine, olanzapine, risperidone, and haloperidol in the treatment of patients with chronic schizophrenia and schizoaffective disorder	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Clozapine (40) Olanzapine (39)	Haloperidol (37)									Unchallenged
97	Frye 2000 A placebo-controlled study of lamotrigine and gabapentin monotherapy in refractory mood disorders	J Clin Psycho pharmacol	Cross- over RCT	Lamotrigine	Gabapentin Placebo (Total Sample Size 31)									Unchallenged
97	Shelton 2001 A novel augmentation strategy for treating resistant major depression	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Olanzapine + Fluoxetine(10)	Olanzapine + Placebo(8) Fluoxetine + Placebo(10)	Shelton 2005 Olanzapine/fluoxetine combination for treatment-resistant depression: a controlled study of SSRI and nortriptyline resistance	Olanzapine + Fluoxetine (146)	Olanzapine + Placebo (144) Fluoxetine + Placebo (142)	Response (MADRS)	OZP+FLX vs. OZP+PLA 1.76 OZP+FLX vs. FLX+PLA 1.43	MADRS	OZP+FLX vs. OZP+PLA 0.24 OZP+FLX vs. FLX+PLA 0.03	0.01 to 0.47 -0.21 to 0.25	Contradicted
92	Brady 2000 Efficacy and safety of sertraline treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Sertraline (94)	Placebo (93)	Davidson 2006 Venlafaxine extended release in posttraumatic stress disorder: a sertraline- and placebo-controlled study	Sertraline (173)	Placebo (179)	CAPS·2	0.30	CAPS-SX ₁₇	0.19	-0.02 to 0.40	Replicated
84	RUPPASG 2001 Fluvoxamine for the treatment of anxiety disorders in children and adolescents	N Engl J Med	RCT	Fluvoxamine (63)	Placebo (65)									Unchallenged
83	Barlow 2000 Cognitive-behavioral therapy, imipramine, or their combination for panic disorder - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	CBT + Imipramine (65)	Imipramine (83) CBT (77) Placebo (24) CBT + Placebo (63)									Unchallenged
82	Tohen 2002 Olanzapine versus divalproex in the treatment of acute mania	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Olanzapine (125)	Divalproex (126)	Tohen 2008 Olanzapine versus divalproex versus placebo in the treatment of mild to moderate mania: a randomized, 12-week, double-blind study	Olanzapine (215)	Divalproex (201)	YMRS	0.31	YMRS	0.14	-0.06 to 0.34	Contradicted
80	Nemets 2002 Addition of omega-3 fatty acid to maintenance medication treatment for recurrent unipolar depressive disorder	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	E-EPA (10)	Placebo (9)	Lesperance 2011 The efficacy of omega-3 supplementation for major depression: a randomized controlled trial	E-EPA (218)	Placebo (214)	HAM-D	1.09	MADRS	0.12 (Marginally Significant)	-0.07 to 0.31	Initially Stronger
80	Sensky 2002 A randomized controlled trial of cognitive-behavioral therapy for persistent symptoms in schizophrenia resistant to medication	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	CBT (46)	nonspecific befriending (44)	Klingberg 2011 Negative symptoms of schizophrenia as primary target of cognitive behavioral therapy: results of the randomized clinical TONES study	CBT (99)	Cognitive Remediation (99)	Comprehensive Psychiatric Rating Scale	0.57	GAF	0.17	-0.11 to 0.45	Contradicted

80	Soares 2002 Efficacy of estradiol for the treatment of depressive disorders in perimenopausal women - A double-blind, randomized, placebo-controlled trial	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	17 beta-estradiol (25)	Placebo (25)						
79	Michelson 2002 Once-daily atomoxetine treatment for children and adolescents with attention deficit hyperactivity disorder: A randomized, placebo-controlled study	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Atomoxetine (85)	Placebo (85)	Newcorn 2008 Atomoxetine and osmotically released methylphenidate for the treatment of attention deficit hyperactivity disorder: acute comparison and differential response	Atomoxetine (222)	Placebo (74)	ADHD Rating Scale–IV	0.71	ADHD Scale
79	Dolder 2002 Antipsychotic medication adherence: Is there a difference between typical and atypical agents?	Am J Psychiatry	Cohort	Atypical Antipsychotics (171)	Typical Antipsychotics (117)						
77	Williams 2000 Treatment of dysthymia and minor depression in primary care - A randomized controlled trial in older adults	JAMA	RCT	Paroxetine (137)	Problem-Solvin g Treatment (138) Placebo (140)						
73	Davidson 2001 Multicenter, double-blind comparison of sertraline and placebo in the treatment of posttraumatic stress disorder	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Sertraline (100)	Placebo (108)	Davidson 2006 Venlafaxine extended release in posttraumatic stress disorder: a sertraline- and placebo-controlled study	Sertraline (173)	Placebo (179)	CAPS-2	0.42	CAPS
67	Sackeim 2001 Continuation pharmacotherapy in the prevention of relapse following electroconvulsive therapy - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Nortriptyline + Lithium (28)	Nortriptyline (27) Placebo (29)						
66	Aman 2002 Double-blind, placebo-controlled study of risperidone for the treatment of disruptive behaviors in children with subaverage intelligence	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Risperidone (55)	Placebo (63)						
65	Robinson 2000 Nortriptyline versus fluoxetine in the treatment of depression and in short-term recovery after stroke: A placebo-controlled, double-blind study	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Nortriptyline (16)	Fluoxetine (23) Placebo (17)						
65	McDougle 2000 A double-blind, placebo-controlled study of risperidone addition in serotonin reuptake inhibitor-refractory obsessive-compulsive disorder	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Risperidone + SSRI (20)	Placebo + SSRI (16)						
56	Johnson 2000 A comparison of levomethadyl acetate, buprenorphine, and methadone for opioid dependence.	N Engl J Med	RCT	High-Dosage Methadone (55)	Levomethadyl acetate (55) Buprenorphine (55) Low-Dosage Methadone (55)						
56	Barrowclough 2001 Randomized controlled trial of motivational interviewing, cognitive behavior therapy, and family intervention for patients with comorbid schizophrenia and substance use disorders	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Integrated care (18)	Routine psychiatric care (18)	Barrowclough 2010 Integrated motivational interviewing and cognitive behavioural therapy for people with psychosis and comorbid substance misuse: randomised controlled trial	Integrated care (164)	Standard care (163)	GAF	0.71	GAF
55	McCall 2000 Titrated moderately suprathreshold vs fixed high-dose right unilateral electroconvulsive therapy - Acute antidepressant and cognitive effects	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Fixed Right Unilateral ECT (36)	Titrated Right Unilateral ECT(36)						

			Unchallenged
ID Rating	0.57	0.30 to 0.84	Replicated
e			
			Unchallenged
			Unchallenged
PS-SX17	0.19 (Marginally Significant)	-0.02 to 0.40	Initially Stronger
			Unchallenged
?	0.07	-0.17 to 0.31	Contradicted
			Unchallenged

55	Katon 2001 A randomized trial of relapse prevention of depression in primary care	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Relapse prevention program (194)	Usual primary care (192)						
52	Kroenke 2001 Similar effectiveness of paroxetine, fluoxetine, and sertraline in primary care - A randomized trial	JAMA	RCT	Fluoxetine (200)	Paroxetine (202) Sertraline (199)						
52	Prins 2001 Cognitive behaviour therapy for chronic fatigue syndrome: a multicentre randomised controlled trial	Lancet	RCT	CBT (93)	Guided Support (94)	White 2011 Comparison of adaptive pacing therapy, cognitive behaviour therapy, graded exercise therapy, and specialist medical care for chronic fatigue syndrome (PACE): a randomised trial	CBT (161)	Adaptive Pacing Therapy (159)	Fatigue Severity	0.67	Chalde Questi
52	Hauser 2002 A prospective study of the incidence and open-label treatment of interferon-induced major depressive disorder in patients with hepatitis C	Mol Psychiatry	Case series	Citalopram (13)	No Control	Kraus 2008 Therapy of interferon-induced depression in chronic hepatitis C with citalopram: a randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled study	Citalopram (14)	Placebo (14)	Effective for 11 of 13 patients	***	HADS
51	Marshall 2001 Efficacy and safety of paroxetine treatment for chronic PTSD: A fixed-dose, placebo-controlled study	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Paroxetine 20mg (183) Paroxetine 40mg (182)	Placebo (186)						
50	Heustis 2001 Blockade of effects of smoked marijuana by the CBI-selective cannabinoid receptor antagonist SR141716	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	SR141716 + Marijuana (6)	Placebo + Marijuana (10)						
49	Johnson 2000 Ondansetron for reduction of drinking among biologically predisposed alcoholic patients - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Ondansetron 1µg/kg Twice Daily (67) 4µg/kg Twice Daily (77) 16µg/kg Twice Daily (71)	Placebo (56)						
48	Scahill 2001 A placebo-controlled study of guanfacine in the treatment of children with tic disorders and attention deficit hyperactivity disorder	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Guanfacine (17)	Placebo (17)	Biederman 2008 A randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled study of guanfacine extended release in children and adolescents with attention-deficit/hyperactivit	Guanfacine ER 2mg (87) 3mg (86) 4mg (86)	Placebo (86)	ADHD Rating Scale	0.65	ADHD Scale-I
48	Wright 2001 Double-blind, placebo-controlled comparison of intramuscular olanzapine and intramuscular haloperidol in the treatment of acute agitation in schizophrenia	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Olanzapine Injection (131)	Haloperidol Injection (126)	y disorder Raveendran 2007 Rapid tranquillisation in psychiatric emergency settings in India: pragmatic randomised controlled trial of intramuscular olanzapine versus intramuscular haloperidol plus promethazine.	Olanzapine Injection (150)	Haloperidol + Promethazine Injection (150)	PANSS	0.03	CGI
48	Meehan 2001 A double-blind, randomized comparison of the efficacy and safety of intramuscular injections of olanzapine, lorazepam, or placebo in treating acutely agitated patients diagnosed with bipolar mania	J Clin Psycho pharmacol	RCT	Olanzapine Injection (99)	Lorazepam Injection (51) Placebo Injection (51)						
48	Alexopoulos 2000 Executive dysfunction and long-term outcomes of geriatric depression	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Nortriptyline (22)	Placebo (21)						
47	Gelenberg 2000 Efficacy of venlafaxine extended-release capsules in nondepressed outpatients with generalized anxiety disorder - A 6-month randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Venlafaxine ER (124)	Placebo (127)	Boyer 2004 Social adjustment in generalised anxiety disorder: a long-term placebo-controlled study of venlafaxine extended release	Venlafaxine ER 37.5mg (138) + 75mg (130) + 150mg (131)	Placebo (130)	HAM-A response	0.61	HAM-2

Unchallenged Unchallenged alder Fatigue estionnaire Initially Stronger 0.370.14 to 0.60 DS 1.11 0.31 to 1.91 Replicatedⁱ⁾ Unchallenged Unchallenged Unchallenged HD Rating ale-IV
 2mg vs. PLA
 0.33 to 0.95

 0.64
 0.35 to 0.97

 3mg vs. PLA
 0.55 to 1.17

 0.66
 0.55 to 1.17
 Replicated 4mg vs. PLA 0.86 0.25 to 0.710.48 Replicated Unchallenged Unchallenged M-A response 0.55 0.35 to 0.75Replicated

47	Wilens 2001 A controlled clinical trial of bupropion for attention deficit hyperactivity disorder in adults	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Bupropion (21)	Placebo (19)	Wilens 2005 Bupropion XL in adults with attention-deficit/hyperactivit y disorder: a randomized, placebo-controlled study	Bupropion XL (81)	Placebo (81)	CGI Improvement	1.23	CGI Improvement	0.60	0.29 to 0.91	Initially Stronger
46	Ball 2002 Effects of cognitive training interventions with older adults - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Memory Training(711) Reasoning Training (705) Speed Training (712)	No Contact (704)									Unchallenged
46	Zhu 2002 Evidence of real-world effectiveness of a telephone quitline for smokers	N Engl J Med	RCT	Telephone Counseling (1973)	Self-help (1309)	Rabius 2007 Effects of frequency and duration in telephone counselling for smoking cessation	Telephone Counseling (4758)	Self-help (1564)	Rate of Prolonged Smoking Abstinence (12 months)	0.17	Enrolled Quit Rate	0.21	0.15 to 0.27	Replicated
46	Agras 2000 A multicenter comparison of cognitive-behavioral therapy and interpersonal psychotherapy for bulimia nervosa	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	CBT (110)	Interpersonal Psychotherapy (110)									Unchallenged
45	Lyketsos 2000 Randomized, placebo-controlled, double-blind clinical trial of sertraline in the treatment of depression complicating Alzheimer's disease: Initial results from the depression in Alzheimer's disease study	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Sertraline (12)	Placebo (10)	Banerjee 2011 Sertraline or mirtazapine for depression in dementia (HTA-SADD): a randomised, multicentre, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial	Sertraline (107)	Placebo (111)	Cornell Scale for Depression in Dementia	1.68	Cornell Scale for Depression in Dementia	0.20	-0.10 to 0.50	Contradicted
45	Maki 2001 Enhanced verbal memory in nondemented elderly women receiving hormone-replacement therapy	Am J Psychiatry	Cohort	Oral or transdermal estrogen-replacem ent therapy (103)	No Use (81)	delayed verbal recall in older women	(70)	Placebo (72)	California Verbal Learning Test Recall of list A, trials 1–5 (words)	η ² =0.26 which corresponds with SMD between 1.0 and 1.25	California Verbal Learning Test short-delay verbal recall	0.27	-0.06 to 0.60	Initially Stronger
45	Heresco 2002 Placebo-controlled trial of D-cycloserine added to conventional neuroleptics, olanzapine, or risperidone in schizophrenia	Am J Psychiatry	Cross- over RCT	D-Cycloserine + Antipsychotic	Placebo + Antipsychotic (Total Sample Size 24)	Goff 2005 A six-month, placebo-controlled trial of D-cycloserine co-administered with conventional antipsychotics in schizophrenia patients	D-Cycloserine + Conventional Antipsychotic (27)	Placebo + Conventional Antipsychotic (28)	PANSS Negative	0.60	PANSS Negative	0.06	-0.47 to 0.59	Contradicted
44	Rickels 2000 Efficacy of extended-release venlafaxine in nondepressed outpatients with generalized anxiety disorder	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Venlafaxine XR 75mg (86) + 150mg (81) + 225mg (86)	Placebo (96)	Boyer 2004 Social adjustment in generalised anxiety disorder: a long-term placebo-controlled study of venlafaxine extended release	Venlafaxine ER 37.5mg (138) + 75mg (130) + 150mg (131)	Placebo (130)	HAM-A Total Score	0.52	HAM-A Response	0.55	0.35 to 0.75	Replicated
44	Belanoff 2001 Rapid reversal of psychotic depression using mifepristone	J Clin Psycho pharmacol	Cross- over RCT	Mifepristone	Placebo (Total Sample Size 5)	Blasey 2011 Efficacy and safety of mifepristone for the treatment of psychotic depression	Mifepristone 300mg (107) + 600mg (107) + 1200mg (109)	Placebo (110)	BPRS	***	BPRS Positive Symptom Subscale Response	0.11	-0.12 to 0.34	Contradicted ⁱⁱ⁾
43	Young 2000 Double-blind comparison of addition of a second mood stabilizer versus an antidepressant to an initial mood stabilizer for treatment of patients with bipolar depression	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Mood stabilizer + Paroxetine (11)	Mood Stabilizer + Another Mood Stabilizer (16)		<u> </u>							Unchallenged
43	Clarke 2001 A randomized trial of a group cognitive intervention for preventing depression in adolescent offspring of depressed parents	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Usual Care + Group Cognitive Prevention Program (45)	Usual Care (49)	Garber 2009 Prevention of depression in at-risk adolescents: a randomized controlled trial	Cognitive Behavioral Prevention Program (159)	Usual Care (157)	CES-D	0.46	CES-D	0.30	0.08 to 0.52	Replicated
42	Ahluwalia 2002 Sustained-release bupropion smoking cessation in African Americans - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Bupropion SR (300)	Placebo (300)									Unchallenged
42	Lecrubier 2002 Efficacy of St. John's Wort extract WS 5570 in major depression: A double-blind, placebo-controlled trial	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Hydroalcoholic Hypericum Perforatum Extract WS 5570 (186)	Placebo (189)									Unchallenged

40	Alldredge 2001 A comparison of lorazepam, diazepam, and placebo for the treatment of out-of-hospital status epilepticus	N Engl J Med	RCT	Lorazepam Injection (66)	Diazepam Injection (68) Placebo Injection (71)									Unchallenged
40	Seidman 2001 Treatment of erectile dysfunction in men with depressive symptoms: Results of a placebo-controlled trial with sildenafil citrate	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Sildenafil (74)	Placebo (78)	Kennedy 2011 A multicenter, double-blind, placebo-controlled study of sildenafil citrate in Canadian men with erectile dysfunction and untreated symptoms of depression, in the absence of major depressive disorder	Sildenafil (104)	Placebo (98)	International Index of Erectile Function Domain	0.99	Successful Intercourse Attempt	0.85	0.56 to 1.14	Replicated
40	Hoffman 2000 Transcranial magnetic stimulation and auditory hallucinations in schizophrenia	Lancet	Cross- over RCT	Left Temporoparietlal Transcranial Magnetic Stimulation	Sham Transcranial Magnetic Stimulation (Total Sample Size 12)	Slotema 2011 Can low-frequency repetitive transcranial magnetic stimulation really relieve medication-resistant auditory verbal hallucinations? Negative results from a large randomized controlled trial	Left Temporal Transcranial Magnetic Stimulation (22)	Sham Transcranial Magnetic Stimulation (20)	Hallucination Severity Score	***	Auditory Hallucination Rating Scale	0.19	-0.42 to 0.80	Contradicted ⁱⁱ⁾
39	Van Ameringen 2001 Sertraline treatment of generalized social phobia: A 20-week, double-blind, placebo-controlled study	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Sertraline (135)	Placebo (69)	Liebowitz 2003 Efficacy of sertraline in severe generalized social anxiety disorder: results of a double-blind, placebo-controlled study	Sertraline (211)	Placebo (204)	Marks Fear Questionnaire	0.76	LSAS Fear/Anxiety	0.44	0.25 to 0.63	Initially Stronger
39	Jarrett 2001 Preventing recurrent depression using cognitive therapy with and without a continuation phase - A randomized clinical trial	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Continuation- Phase Cognitive Therapy (41)	Evaluation Only (43)	¥								Unchallenged
38	Bondareff 2000 Comparison of sertraline and nortriptyline in the treatment of major depressive disorder in late life	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Sertraline (105)	Nortryptyline (105)									Unchallenged
38	O'Hara 2000 Efficacy of interpersonal psychotherapy for postpartum depression	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Interpersonal Psychotherapy (60)	Waiting List (60)									Unchallenged
37	Bateman 2001 Treatment of borderline personality disorder with psychoanalytically oriented partial hospitalization: An 18-month follow-up	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Psychoanalyticall y Oriented Partial Hospitalization Program (22)										Unchallenged
36	Donovan 2000 Divalproex treatment for youth with explosive temper and mood lability: A double-blind, placebo-controlled crossover design	Am J Psychiatry	Cross- over RCT	Divalproex	Placebo (Total Sample Size 20)	Hellings 2005 A double-blind, placebo-controlled study of valproate for aggression in youth with pervasive developmental disorders	Valproate (16)	Placebo (14)	Modified Overt Aggression Scale and Six Items from the Anger- Hostility Subscale of the SCL-90	***	The Aberrant Behavior Checklist—Comm unity Scale (ABC-C) Irritability Subscale	0.28	-0.44 to 1.00	Contradicted ⁱⁱ⁾
36	Kane 2001 Clozapine and haloperidol in moderately refractory schizophrenia - A 6-month randomized and double-blind comparison	Arch Gen Psychiatry	RCT	Clozapine (37)	Haloperidol (34)	Volavka 2002 Clozapine, olanzapine, risperidone, and haloperidol in the treatment of patients with chronic schizophrenia and schizoaffective disorder	Clozapine (40)	Haloperidol (37)	BPRS response	0.80	PANSS total	0.31	-0.14 to 0.76	Initially Stronger
35	Rehm 2001 Feasibility, safety, and efficacy of injectable heroin prescription for refractory opioid addicts: a follow-up study	Lancet	Cohort	Heroin Prescription (237)	No Control	Haasen 2007 Heroin-assisted treatment for opioid dependence: randomised controlled trial	Heroin Injection (515)	Oral Methadone (500)	***	***	Improvement in Health	0.19	0.07 to 0.31	Replicated ⁱⁱⁱ⁾
35	Holroyd 2001 Management of chronic tension-type headache with tricyclic antidepressant medication, stress management therapy, and their combination - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	Tricyclic Antidepressant + Stress Management (53)	Tricyclic Antidepressant (53) Stress Management + Placebo (49) Placebo (48)									Unchallenged

35	Targum 2001 Efficacy of quetiapine in Parkinson's patients with psychosis	J Clin Psycho pharmacol	Case series	Quetiapine (11)	No Control	Rabey 2007 Effect of quetiapine in psychotic Parkinson's disease patients: a double-blind labeled study of 3 months' duration	Quetiapine (30)	Placebo (28)	BPRS	***	BPRS	0.28	-0.25 to 0.81	Contradicted ⁱⁱ⁾
35	Heinala 2001 Targeted use of naltrexone without prior detoxification in the treatment of alcohol dependence: A factorial double-blind, placebo-controlled trial	J Clin Psycho pharmacol	Factorial design	Coping + Naltrexone	Coping + Placebo (Total Sample Size 121)	Monti 2001 Naltrexone and cue exposure with coping and communication skills training for alcoholics: treatment process and 1-year outcomes	Coping Skills Training and Communication Skills Training + Naltrexone	Coping Skills Training and Communicati on Skills Training + Placebo	Never Relapse	1.35	% Heavy Drinking Days	***	***	Contradicted ⁱⁱ⁾
34	Bailine 2000 Comparison of bifrontal and bitemporal ECT for major depression	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Bifrontal ECT (24)	Bitemporal ECT (24)	Kellner 2010 Bifrontal, bitemporal and right unilateral electrode placement in ECT: randomised trial	Bifrontal ECT (81)	Bitemporal ECT (72)	MMSE	0.69	MMSE	0.02	-0.32 to 0.36	Contradicted
34	Stein 2002 Adjunctive olanzapine for SSRI-resistant combat-related PTSD: A double-blind, placebo-controlled study	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	SSRI + Olanzapine (10)	SSRI + Placebo (9)									Unchallenged
34	Pollock 2002 Comparison of citalopram, perphenazine, and placebo for the acute treatment of psychosis and behavioral disturbances in hospitalized, demented patients	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	Citalopram (31)	Perphenazine (33) Placebo (21)									Unchallenged
33	Edinger 2001 Cognitive behavioral therapy for treatment of chronic primary insomnia - A randomized controlled trial	JAMA	RCT	CBT (25)	Progressive muscle relaxation (25) Placebo treatment (25)									Unchallenged
33	Emsley 2002 Randomized, placebo-controlled study of ethyl-eicosapentaenoic acid as supplemental treatment in schizophrenia	Am J Psychiatry	RCT	E-EPA (20)	Placebo (20)	Emsley 2006 The effects of eicosapentaenoic acid in tardive dyskinesia: A randomized, placebo-controlled trial	E-EPA (39)	Placebo (38)	PANSS	0.70	PANSS	0.02	-0.43 to 0.47	Contradicted
33	Muller-Oerlinghausen 2000 Valproate as an adjunct to neuroleptic medication for the treatment of acute episodes of mania: A prospective, randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled, multicenter study	J Clin Psycho pharmacol	RCT	Valproate + Basic Neuroleptic (69)	Placebo + Basic Neuroleptic (67)									Unchallenged
31	Rabinowitz 2001 Rehospitalization rates of chronically ill schizophrenic patients discharged on a regimen of risperidone, olanzapine, or conventional antipsychotics Abbrebations : N Engl J Med	Am J Psychiatry	Cohort	Risperidone (268) Olanzapine (313)	Conventional Antipsychotics (458)	Crespo-Facorro 2011 Relapse prevention and remission attainment in first-episode non-affective psychosis. A randomized, controlled 1-year follow-up comparison of haloperidol, risperidone and olanzapine	Risperidone (63) Olanzapine (55)	Haloperidol (56)	Rehospitalization	RIS vs. CON 0.35 OZP vs. CON 0.40	Relapse data to calculate SMD	RIS vs. HPD -0.33 OZP vs. HPD -0.14	-0.70 to 0.04 -0.52 to 0.24	Contradicted

Abbrebations - N Engl J Med, New England Journal of Medicine, JAMA, Journal of the American Medical Association; Arch Gen Psychiatry, Archives of General Psychiatry; Mol Psychiatry, Molecular Psychiatry; Am J Psychiatry, American Journal of Psychiatry; J Clin Psychopharmacol, Journal of Clinical Psychopharmacology

Details of qualitative judgement for replication

i) We could notobtain SMD of the previous study. SMD of the subsequent study was, however, very large and the two authors judged "replicated".

ii) The subsequent study denied the treatment effect.

iii) We could not obtain SMD of the previous study. The subsequent study recommended this treatment to be effective, but thereported SMD was 0.19.

One author gave judgement as "Initially stronger effect", and another author "replicated". The third author adjudicated and judged as "replicated".