Appendix B-2: The Robustness of the Results to Alternative Dynamics

Notes: The B&K method uses pooled OLS with a LDV and PCSE's. It should be noted that in their initial studies, Cox et al. (1998) and Zahariadas (2001) did not use PCSE's and Saideman et al. (2002) also used the Prais-Winston in addition to the basic B&K method; however, to be consistent we used the B&K method when performing replications for this table. Also, note that our "original results" for Saideman et al. are slightly different than what the authors report in their paper. After dropping the observations with missing data, we had a few less observations then they use in their reported models. We felt justified in including their article in this study despite that discrepency because the results are not different in any significant way from what they report. We tested the robustness of the B&K method results by running 5 other model specifications: pooled OLS without the LDV, Prais-Winston without the LDV, lagged indepent variables (LIV's), LIV's and LDV, first-difference model. We used PCSE's in all of the models.

Cox, Thies, & Rosenbluth (WP, 1998)

DV= Total expenditures per elector	B&K		NO LDV		PRAIS-WINSTON		LDV + LIVS		LIVs		FIRST DIFF	
Independent Variables (Table 1, Model 1)	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.
Victory margin: last winner- first loser	**-0.191**	0.056	**-0.222**	0.053	**-0.200**	0.052	**0.107**	0.051	**0.017**	0.055	**-0.175**	0.038
R^2	0.825		0.793		0.688							
N*T=	999		999				876		876			
Test for Autocorrelation	0.388	0.053	0.523	0.031			-0.351	0.076	0.468	0.034	-0.356	0.039

DV= Voter turnout												
Independent Variables (Table 2, Model 2)												
Victory Margin	**-0.0931**	0.0186	**-0.104**	0.0163	**-0.085**	0.0115	**-0.089**	0.0193	**-0.081**	0.0178	**-0.083**	0.0223
Total Expend.	**0.0384**	0.0195	**-0.062**	0.0204	**0.0406**	0.0102	**0.0391**	0.0187	**0.0644**	0.0181	**0.0648**	0.0478
Percent urban	**-0.059**	0.017	**-0.764**	1.491	**-0.112**	0.018	**0.027**	0.055	**-0.056**	0.065	**0.065**	0.017
Percent pop < 15	**0.419**	0.216	**4.920**	1.091	**0.626**	0.159	**1.244**	1.239	**1.588**	0.906	**0.554**	1.667
Percent men	**-0.489**	0.546	**-0.124**	0.015	**-0.721**	0.355	**4.089**	4.757	**5.445**	3.261	**0.912**	6.094
R^2	0.799		0.717		0.886							
N*T=	999		999									
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.268	0.079	0.565	0.031			-0.543	0.063	0.539	0.036	-0.482	0.038

Hood, Kidd, & Morris (LSQ, 2001)

DV=Unadjusted LCCR scores	B&K		NO LDV		PRAIS-WINSTON		LDV + LIVS		LIVs		FIRST DIFF	
Independent Variables (Table 1, Col. 1)	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.
GOP	**0.487**	0.210	**0.775**	0.224	**0.793**	0.188	**-1.186**	0.812	**-1.117**	0.835	**-1.101**	1.059
Black Electoral Strength	**1.799**	0.604	**2.631**	0.603	**2.225**	0.500	**0.869**	0.921	**1.231**	0.950	**0.127**	1.199
R^2	0.514		0.466				0.561		0.524		0.128	
N*T=	594		616				594		594		594	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.154	0.112	0.257	0.042			-0.395	0.109	0.235	0.046	-0.490	0.043

Pickering (JPR, 2002)

DV=Foreign Military Intervention	B&K		NO LDV		PRAIS-WINSTON		LDV + LIVS		LIVs		FIRST DIFF	
Independent Variables (Table 2, Col. 2)	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.	Coeff.	S.E.
War experience	**0.069**	0.028	**0.080**	0.027	**0.080**	0.027	**0.156**	0.260	**0.154**	0.264	**0.164**	0.333
War experience squared	**0.048**	0.015	**0.057**	0.015	**0.056**	0.011	**0.051**	0.105	**0.092**	0.105	**-0.170**	0.136
R^2			0.039		0.027		0.063		0.041		0.004	

	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
N*T=	2664		2664				2559		2559		2559	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.631	0.196	0.152	0.031			-0.491	0.187	0.165	0.032	-0.461	0.030

Moene and Wallerstein (APSR, 2001)

DV= Government Spending for income insurance as a share of GDP

Independent Variables (Table 1, Col. 2)	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
Inequality (90/10)	**-1.933**	0.346	**-4.442**	0.066	**2.977**	2.605	**2.654**	1.149	**3.222**	4.946	**2.886**	1.569
R^2	0.901		0.582		0.4627		0.915		0.667		0.459	
N*T=	50		50		50		32		32		32	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.126	0.246	0.880	0.150			-0.809	0.301	0.525	0.362	-0.589	0.268
Independent Variables (Table 1, Col. 5)												
Inequality (50/10)	**-1.306**	0.573	**-4.696**	0.386	**1.831**	1.937	**2.544**	1.382	**5.672**	4.515	**1.829**	2.081
Inequality (90/50)	**-1.531**	0.954	**-2.761**	0.601	**-0.675**	4.498	**-4.281**	3.651	**-23.736**	4.870	**-0.695**	3.343
R^2	0.898		0.517		0.4331		0.913		0.715		0.431	
N*T=	50		50		50		32		32		32	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.204	0.259	0.825	0.132			-1.478		0.527	0.746	-0.758	0.359

Poe & Tate (APSR, 1994)

DV= Governmental repression of personal integrity rights (Amnesty International)

Independent Variable	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
(Table 1, Col. 1): Democracy (Freedom House)	**-0.045**	0.017	**-0.160**	0.016	**-0.151**	0.025	**-0.097**	0.041	**-0.090**	0.069	**-0.103**	0.043
R^2	0.772		0.517		0.412		0.773		0.518		0.018	
N*T=	1071		1071				1071		1071		1071	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.354	0.058	-0.354	0.058			-0.392	0.057	0.726	0.026	-0.388	0.040
(Table 1, Col. 2): Democracy (Vanhanen Measure)	**-0.009**	0.003	**0.030**	0.003	**-0.024**	0.005	**-0.007**	0.008	**-0.010**	0.011	**-0.006**	0.008
R^2	0.766		0.514		0.403		0.766		0.517		0.000	
N*T=	994		994									
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.370	0.056	-0.370	0.056			-0.400	0.057	0.713	0.028	-0.397	0.033

DV= Governmental repression of personal integrity rights (State Department)

Independent Variable	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
Table 1, Col. 3: Democracy (Freedom House)	**-0.062**	0.019	**-0.167**	0.015	**-0.170**	0.019	**-0.145**	0.046	**-0.128**	0.059	**-0.155**	0.052
R^2	0.748		0.569		0.395		0.752		0.572		0.036	
N*T=	1071		1071									
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.429	0.076	-0.429	0.076			-0.472	0.074	1.000	0.000	-0.422	0.052
Table 1, Col. 4: Democracy (Vanhanen Measure)	**-0.010**	0.003	**-0.026**	0.003	**-0.022**	0.004	**-0.005**	0.009	**-0.006**	0.010	**-0.004**	0.011
R^2	0.745		0.556		0.371		0.744		0.563		-0.003	
N*T=	994		994									
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.468	0.078	-0.468	0.078			-0.473	0.077	0.637	0.039	-0.434	0.053

Reich (PRQ, 1999)

DV= Seniorage

Independent Variables (Table 1, Col. 3)	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
New Democracy (first democratic gov't)	**1.064**	0.461	**1.713**	0.553	**0.792**	0.435	**0.944**	1.065	**0.724**	1.157	**1.910**	1.245
R^2	0.454		0.260		0.696		0.508		0.355		0.150	
N*T=	100		100		100		90		90		90	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.418	0.220	-0.079	0.217			-0.570	0.263	0.329	0.140	-0.372	0.149

DV= Seniorage

Independent Variables (Table 1, Col. 4)	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
New Democracy (less than 10 years continuo	**1.360**	0.551	**2.149**	0.703	**0.871**	0.552	**2.330**	1.332	**1.446**	1.607	**3.269**	1.467
R^2	0.456		0.262		0.687		0.525		0.366		0.173	
N*T=	100		100		100		90		90		90	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.389	0.217	-0.028	0.211			-0.539	0.257	0.338	0.149	-0.323	0.152

Saideman, Lanoue, Campenni, & Stanton (CPS, 2002)

DV= Protest

Independent Variables (Table 1, Col. 1)	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
Regime type	**0.019**	0.006	**0.065**	0.007	**0.057**	0.009	**0.041**	0.014	**0.071**	0.019	**0.043**	0.017
Enduring regime	**0.026**	0.047	**0.105**	0.070	**0.014**	0.088	**-0.127**	0.118	**-0.036**	0.156	**-0.167**	0.119
Young democracy	**0.029**	0.057	**0.101**	0.090	**-0.017**	0.098	**0.031**	0.117	**0.097**	0.127	**-0.018**	0.145
First election	**0.087**	0.116	**-0.096**	0.156	**-0.083**	0.085	**0.094**	0.115	**-0.198**	0.161	**-0.085**	0.085
Proportional democracy	**-0.128**	0.047	**-0.442**	0.050	**-0.465**	0.119	**-0.758**	0.217	**-0.818**	0.254	**-0.771**	0.254
Federal system	**0.123**	0.048	**0.288**	0.050	**0.322**	0.123	**0.123**	0.042	**0.311**	0.045	(dropped)	
R^2	0.530		0.163		0.061		0.594		0.161		0.005	
N*T=	2554		2574		2574		2281		2293		2281	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.214	0.037	0.724	0.018			-0.265	0.042	0.722	0.019	-0.307	0.029

DV= Protest (Democracies)

Independent Variables (Table 2, Col. 1)	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
Enduring regime	**0.047**	0.068	**0.137**	0.076	**0.007**	0.155	**-0.270**	0.190	**-0.024**	0.258	**-0.385**	0.179
First election	**-0.188**	0.213	**-0.249**	0.228	**-0.280**	0.152	**-0.144**	0.181	**-0.353**	0.253	**-0.201**	0.135
Electoral system	**0.001**	0.002	**-0.001**	0.002	**0.003**	0.003	**0.009**	0.005	**-0.001**	0.006	**0.013**	0.005
Parliamentary	**0.055**	0.030	**0.120**	0.024	**0.168**	0.072	**0.529**	0.206	**0.348**	0.209	**0.600**	0.233
Federal system	**0.117**	0.087	**0.354**	0.066	**0.453**	0.149	**0.052**	0.351	**-0.207**	0.587	**0.190**	0.375
R^2	0.456		0.115		0.089		0.512		0.110		0.011	
N*T	1322		1325		1325		1223		1225		1223	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.264	0.056	0.673	0.027			-0.282	0.057	0.671	0.028	-0.326	0.037

Zahariadas (ISQ, 2001)

DV=Total Aid

Independent Variables (Table 2, Col. 1)	B&K Coeff.	B&K S.E.	NO LDV Coeff.	NO LDV S.E.	PRAIS-WINSTON Coeff.	PRAIS-WINSTON S.E.	LDV + LIVS Coeff.	LDV + LIVS S.E.	LIVs Coeff.	LIVs S.E.	FIRST DIFF Coeff.	FIRST DIFF S.E.
Research and Development	**-1.481**	0.423	**-0.517**	0.426	**-0.713**	0.480	**-2.133**	0.448	**-2.317**	0.998	**-0.842**	0.079
Research and Development Squared	**0.297**	0.123	**-0.021**	0.109	**0.117**	0.124	**0.448**	0.118	**0.436**	0.267	**0.165**	0.036

Job gain	**-0.002**	0.013	**0.005**	0.012	**-0.017**	0.010	**-0.003**	0.006	**-0.001**	0.008	**-0.016**	0.013
R^2	0.981		0.940		0.903		0.985		0.946		0.236	
$N*T=$	52		52				39		39		39	
Test for Autocorrelation	-0.604	0.213	0.725	0.163			-0.876	0.377	0.617	0.226	-0.187	0.258