**Appendix**

1. **Descriptive Statistics of Imputed Dataset**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | N | Mean | Standard Dev. | Min | Max |
| Number of Proposals | 512,496 | 0.84 | 1.44 | 0 | 30 |
| Prov. Government | 497,844 | 0.16 | 0.37 | -1.34 | 1.60 |
| Local Government | 497,839 | 0.17 | 0.38 | -1.19 | 1.43 |
| Academics | 498,536 | 0.16 | 0.36 | -1.20 | 1.49 |
| Professionals | 498,484 | 0.10 | 0.29 | -0.94 | 1.15 |
| Entrepreneurs | 498,521 | 0.22 | 0.41 | -1.36 | 1.61 |
| Gender | 510,588 | 0.21 | 0.41 | 0 | 1 |
| Experience | 511,344 | 0.44 | 0.50 | 0 | 1 |
| Party Membership | 499,591 | 0.39 | 0.48 | -1.26 | 2.13 |
| Education | 475,741 | 2.65 | 0.78 | -0.93 | 6.21 |
| Native | 475,824 | 0.62 | 0.48 | -1.41 | 3.07 |
| Ethnic Minority | 509,112 | 0.08 | 0.26 | 0 | 1 |
| Leadership | 503,532 | 0.18 | 0.38 | 0 | 1 |

1. **Descriptive Statistics of Non-imputed Dataset**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | N | Mean | Standard Dev. | Min | Max |
| Number of Proposals | 14,236 | 0.84 | 1.44 | 0 | 30 |
| Provincial Government | 13,621 | 0.16 | 0.37 | 0 | 1 |
| Local Government | 13,616 | 0.17 | 0.38 | 0 | 1 |
| Academics | 13,692 | 0.16 | 0.36 | 0 | 1 |
| Professionals | 13,675 | 0.10 | 0.29 | 0 | 1 |
| Entrepreneurs | 13,677 | 0.22 | 0.41 | 0 | 1 |
| Gender | 14,183 | 0.21 | 0.41 | 0 | 1 |
| Experience | 14,204 | 0.44 | 0.50 | 0 | 1 |
| Party Member | 12,951 | 0.39 | 0.49 | 0 | 1 |
| Education | 8,741 | 2.68 | 0.78 | 1 | 4 |
| Native | 8,194 | 0.64 | 0.48 | 0 | 1 |
| Ethnic Minority | 14,144 | 0.08 | 0.26 | 0 | 1 |
| Leadership | 13,987 | 0.18 | 0.38 | 0 | 1 |

1. **Data Missingness**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Variable | Missing Values | Percentage of Missing Values | Imputed Observations |
| Provincial Government | 615 | 4.32 | 214 |
| Local Government | 620 | 4.36 | 219 |
| Academics | 544 | 3.82 | 161 |
| Professionals | 561 | 3.94 | 177 |
| Entrepreneurs | 559 | 3.93 | 176 |
| Gender | 53 | 0.37 | - |
| Experience | 32 | 0.22 | - |
| Party Membership | 1285 | 9.03 | 953 |
| Education | 5495 | 38.60 | 4602 |
| Native | 6042 | 42.44 | 5167 |
| Ethnic Minority | 92 | 0.65 | - |
| Leadership | 249 | 1.75 | - |
| Location | 1128 | 7.92 | - |

1. **Descriptive Data on Provinces**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Province 1 | Province 2 | Average | Median |
| Log GDP per capita[[1]](#footnote-1) | 1,75 | 1,76 | 1,80 | 1,75 |
| Log Population[[2]](#footnote-2) | 6,98 | 7,80 | 7,54 | 7,59 |
| Log Area[[3]](#footnote-3) | 4,53 | 5,14 | 5,22 | 5,23 |
| Urban Population[[4]](#footnote-4) | 59,26 | 55,81 | 60,85 | 59,44 |
| CCP Penetration[[5]](#footnote-5) | 516 | 530 | 587 | 590 |
| Proposals submitted/Delegate[[6]](#footnote-6) | 1,57 | 1,26 | 1,24 | 1,30 |
| Proposals filed/Delegate[[7]](#footnote-7) | 1,47 | 1,15 | 1,09 | 1,19 |

1. **Analysis on non-imputed dataset**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.06) | |  | |  | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.07) | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.07) | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.07) |
| Local Government | | 0.15\*\*  (0.05) | |  | |  | 0.16\*\*  (0.06) | 0.17\*\*  (0.06) | 0.18\*\*  (0.06) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.10†  (0.06) | |  | 0.02  (0.07) | 0.01  (0.07) | -0.005  (0.07) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.26\*\*  (0.08) | |  | 0.19\*  (0.09) | 0.21\*  (0.09) | 0.23\*\*  (0.09) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.05  (0.06) | -0.08  (0.07) | -0.06  (0.07) | -0.03  (0.07) |
| Gender | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.05) | | 0.22\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Experience | | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Party Membership | | -0.70\*\*\*  (0.05) | | -0.75\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.79\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.70\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.70\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.68\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Education | | -0.06\*  (0.03) | | -0.10\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.08\*\*  (0.03) | -0.07\*  (0.03) | -0.08\*\*  (0.03) | -0.08\*\*  (0.03) |
| Native | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.12\*\*  (0.05) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.08  (0.07) | | 0.18\*\*  (0.07) | | 0.17\*  (0.07) | 0.08  (0.07) | 0.06  (0.07) | 0.11  (0.07) |
| Leadership | | -0.26\*\*\*  (0.05) | | -0.37\*\*\*  (0.05) | | -0.38\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.26\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.25\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.25\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Year-FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province-FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| Pseudo R² | | 0.04 | | 0.03 | | 0.03 | 0.04 | 0.05 | 0.05 |
| N | | 6,672 | | 6,702 | | 6,702 | 6,672 | 6,672 | 6,672 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Outliers excluded (> 20 Proposals)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.47\*\*\*  (0.05) | |  | |  | -0.46\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.46\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.46\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Local Government | | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | |  | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.11\*  (0.05) | 0.09†  (0.05) | 0.06  (0.05) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.13\*\*  (0.04) | -0.12\*\*  (0.04) | -0.07†  (0.04) |
| Gender | | 0.33\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.35\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.33\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.30\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.30\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.29\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Experience | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Party Membership | | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.58\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.65\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.55\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Education | | 0.04\*  (0.02) | | -0.02  (0.02) | | 0.007  (0.02) | -0.0007  (0.02) | -0.009  (0.02) | -0.007  (0.02) |
| Native | | 0.10\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.12\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.09\*\*  (0.03) | 0.08\*  (0.03) | 0.08\*  (0.03) | 0.03  (0.03) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.11\*  (0.05) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) | | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.10\*  (0.05) | 0.07  (0.05) | 0.13\*\*  (0.05) |
| Leadership | | -0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.28\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.30\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Year-FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province-FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| N | | 13,058 | | 13,058 | | 13,058 | 13,058 | 13,058 | 13,058 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Outliers excluded (> 15 Proposals)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.46\*\*\*  (0.05) | |  | |  | -0.46\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.46\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.45\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Local Government | | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | |  | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.10\*  (0.05) | 0.09†  (0.05) | 0.06  (0.05) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.15\*\*  (0.04) | -0.14\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.09\*  (0.04) |
| Gender | | 0.34\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.36\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.34\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.31\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.31\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.30\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Experience | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Party Membership | | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.65\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.55\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Education | | 0.05\*  (0.02) | | -0.005  (0.02) | | 0.02  (0.02) | 0.01  (0.02) | 0.003  (0.02) | 0.005  (0.02) |
| Native | | 0.10\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.12\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.09\*\*  (0.03) | 0.08\*  (0.03) | 0.08\*  (0.03) | 0.03  (0.03) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.12\*  (0.05) | | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.05) | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.11\*  (0.05) | 0.08†  (0.05) | 0.13\*\*  (0.05) |
| Leadership | | -0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.28\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.30\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Year-FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province-FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| N | | 13,053 | | 13,053 | | 13,053 | 13,053 | 13,053 | 13,053 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Outliers excluded (> 10 Proposals)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.43\*\*\*  (0.05) | |  | |  | -0.42\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.42\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.41\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Local Government | | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | |  | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.10\*  (0.05) | 0.09†  (0.05) | 0.06  (0.05) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.19\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.14\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.13\*\*  (0.04) | -0.08\*  (0.04) |
| Gender | | 0.35\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.36\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.34\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.32\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.31\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.30\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Experience | | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.15\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.15\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Party Membership | | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.58\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.66\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.58\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.58\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.57\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Education | | 0.06\*\*  (0.02) | | 0.005  (0.02) | | 0.02  (0.02) | 0.02  (0.02) | 0.01  (0.02) | 0.01  (0.02) |
| Native | | 0.12\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.13\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.11\*\*  (0.03) | 0.09\*\*  (0.03) | 0.09\*\*  (0.03) | 0.04  (0.03) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.12\*\*  (0.05) | | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.05) | | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.11\*  (0.05) | 0.09\*  (0.05) | 0.14\*\*  (0.05) |
| Leadership | | -0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.28\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.30\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Year FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| N | | 13,027 | | 13,027 | | 13,027 | 13,027 | 13,027 | 13,027 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Delegates not based in the two provinces excluded**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.52\*\*\*  (0.05) | |  | |  | -0.50\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.50\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.49\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Local Government | | 0.15\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | |  | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.15\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.09†  (0.05) | 0.07  (0.05) | 0.05  (0.05) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.14\*\*  (0.05) | 0.14\*\*  (0.05) | 0.14\*\*  (0.05) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.06†  (0.04) | -0.04  (0.05) | -0.04  (0.05) | -0.01  (0.04) |
| Gender | | 0.29\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.32\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.31\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.28\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.28\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.27\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Experience | | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Party Membership | | -0.62\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.66\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.70\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.61\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.61\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.60\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Education | | -0.02  (0.02) | | -0.06\*\*  (0.02) | | -0.03  (0.02) | -0.04†  (0.02) | -0.05\*  (0.02) | -0.04†  (0.02) |
| Native | | 0.12\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.13\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.12\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.11\*\*  (0.03) | 0.12\*\*  (0.03) | 0.07\*  (0.04) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.09†  (0.05) | | 0.16\*\*  (0.05) | | 0.15\*\*  (0.05) | 0.08†  (0.05) | 0.05  (0.05) | 0.10\*  (0.05) |
| Leadership | | -0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.31\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.33\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.22\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Year FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| N | | 12,343 | | 12,343 | | 12,343 | 12,343 | 12,343 | 12,343 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Province 3 (Imputed)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Number of Proposals | | | | | |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 |
| Prov. Government | -0.24\*  (0.10) |  |  | -0.14  (0.11) | -0.14  (0.11) |
| Local Government | 0.31\*\*\*  (0.07) |  |  | 0.41\*\*\*  (0.09) | 0.41\*\*\*  (0.09) |
| Academics |  | 0.02  (0.08) |  | 0.15  (0.10) | 0.14  (0.10) |
| Professionals |  | 0.43\*\*\*  (0.09) |  | 0.53\*\*\*  (0.10) | 0.53\*\*\*  (0.10) |
| Entrepreneurs |  |  | -0.26\*\*\*  (0.07) | -0.07  (0.09) | -0.07  (0.09) |
| Gender | 0.25\*\*\*  (0.06) | 0.29\*\*\*  (0.06) | 0.27\*\*\*  (0.06) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.06) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.06) |
| Party Membership | -0.45\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.49\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.53\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.44\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.44\*\*\*  (0.06) |
| Education | 0.07\*  (0.03) | 0.05  (0.04) | 0.03  (0.03) | 0.02  (0.04) | 0.02  (0.04) |
| Native | 0.19\*\*  (0.06) | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.06) | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.06) | 0.16\*\*  (0.06) | 0.15\*\*  (0.06) |
| Ethnic Minority | 0.23†  (0.14) | 0.31\*  (0.14) | 0.24†  (0.14) | 0.23†  (0.13) | 0.22†  (0.13) |
| Leadership | 0.02  (0.06) | -0.003  (0.06) | -0.03  (0.06) | 0.05  (0.06) | 0.05  (0.06) |
| Year FE |  |  |  |  | √ |
| N | 2,345 | 2,345 | 2,345 | 2,345 | 2,345 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Province 3 (Non-Imputed)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Number of Proposals | | | | | |
|  | Model 1 | Model 2 | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 |
| Prov. Government | -0.35\*\*  (0.11) |  |  | -0.26\*  (0.13) | -0.14  (0.11) |
| Local Government | 0.29\*\*\*  (0.07) |  |  | 0.38\*\*\*  (0.10) | 0.41\*\*\*  (0.09) |
| Academics |  | 0.06  (0.09) |  | 0.15  (0.11) | 0.14  (0.10) |
| Professionals |  | 0.46\*\*\*  (0.09) |  | 0.52\*\*\*  (0.11) | 0.53\*\*\*  (0.10) |
| Entrepreneurs |  |  | -0.36\*\*\*  (0.08) | -0.16  (0.11) | -0.07  (0.09) |
| Gender | 0.19\*\*  (0.07) | 0.20\*\*  (0.07) | 0.17\*  (0.07) | 0.16\*  (0.07) | 0.24\*\*\*  (0.06) |
| Party Membership | -0.42\*\*\*  (0.07) | -0.49\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.54\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.41\*\*\*  (0.07) | -0.44\*\*\*  (0.06) |
| Education | 0.08\*  (0.03) | 0.04  (0.04) | 0.02  (0.03) | 0.02  (0.04) | 0.02  (0.04) |
| Native | 0.19\*\*  (0.07) | 0.21\*\*  (0.06) | 0.20\*\*  (0.06) | 0.15\*  (0.07) | 0.15\*\*  (0.06) |
| Ethnic Minority | 0.31\*  (0.15) | 0.41\*\*  (0.15) | 0.31\*  (0.15) | 0.30\*  (0.15) | 0.22†  (0.13) |
| Leadership | 0.002  (0.07) | -0.04  (0.07) | -0.07  (0.07) | 0.03  (0.07) | 0.05  (0.06) |
| Year FE |  |  |  |  | √ |
| N | 1,862 | 1,869 | 1,869 | 1,861 | 2,345 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Provinces 1-3 (Imputed)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.44\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | |  | -0.43\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.43\*\*\*  (0.05) | -0.42\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Local Government | | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.03) | |  | |  | 0.22\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.22\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.23\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.13\*\*  (0.04) | 0.12\*\*  (0.04) | 0.10\*  (0.04) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.26\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.23\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.16\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.13\*\*  (0.04) |
| Gender | | 0.31\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.33\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.30\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.28\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.28\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.27\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Party Membership | | -0.55\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.56\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.65\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.55\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.55\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.54\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Education | | 0.02  (0.02) | | -0.04\*  (0.02) | | -0.02  (0.02) | -0.03†  (0.02) | -0.04\*  (0.02) | -0.03†  (0.02) |
| Native | | 0.13\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.14\*\*\*  (0.03) | | 0.11\*\*\*  (0.03) | 0.10\*\*  (0.03) | 0.10\*\*  (0.03) | 0.07\*  (0.03) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.11\*  (0.05) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.09\*  (0.05) | 0.07†  (0.04) | 0.11\*  (0.03) |
| Leadership | | -0.14\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.20\*\*\*  (0.03) | | -0.23\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.13\*\*\*  (0.03) | -0.12\*\*  (0.03) | -0.14\*\*\*  (0.03) |
| Year FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| N | | 16,276 | | 16,276 | | 16,276 | 16,276 | 16,276 | 16,276 |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Provinces 1-3 (Non-imputed)**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | |  | | Number of Proposals | | | | |
|  | | Model 1 | | Model 2 | | Model 3 | Model 4 | Model 5 | Model 6 |
| Prov. Government | | -0.54\*\*\*  (0.05) | |  | |  | -0.52\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.52\*\*\*  (0.06) | -0.53\*\*\*  (0.06) |
| Local Government | | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | |  | |  | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Academics | |  | | 0.12\*  (0.05) | |  | 0.05  (0.06) | 0.04  (0.06) | 0.03  (0.06) |
| Professionals | |  | | 0.32\*\*\*  (0.06) | |  | 0.26\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.28\*\*\*  (0.07) | 0.30\*\*\*  (0.07) |
| Entrepreneurs | |  | |  | | -0.13\*\*  (0.05) | -0.11†  (0.06) | -0.10†  (0.06) | -0.07  (0.06) |
| Gender | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.22\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.20\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.16\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Party Membership | | -0.65\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.71\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.77\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.66\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.66\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.65\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Education | | -0.04†  (0.02) | | -0.08\*\*  (0.02) | | -0.06\*\*  (0.02) | -0.06\*  (0.02) | -0.06\*\*  (0.02) | -0.06\*  (0.02) |
| Native | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.21\*\*\*  (0.04) | | 0.19\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.18\*\*\*  (0.04) | 0.14\*\*\*  (0.04) |
| Ethnic Minority | | 0.10†  (0.06) | | 0.21\*\*  (0.06) | | 0.19\*\*  (0.06) | 0.10†  (0.06) | 0.09  (0.06) | 0.13\*  (0.06) |
| Leadership | | -0.17\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.27\*\*\*  (0.04) | | -0.29\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.16\*\*\*  (0.04) | -0.15\*\*  (0.05) | -0.18\*\*\*  (0.05) |
| Year FE | |  | |  | |  |  | √ | √ |
| Province FE | |  | |  | |  |  |  | √ |
| N | | 8,534 | | 8,571 | | 8,571 | 8,533 | 8,533 |  |

Note: † p < 0.1, \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001, Standard errors in parentheses.

1. **Importance of Locations for Delegate Behavior**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Model 4 | |
| Independent Variables | Omitted |
| Location | Coefficient |
| 1 | -0.23 (1.35) |
| 2 | -0.14 (1.35) |
| 3 | -0.39 (1.36) |
| 4 | -0.35 (1.51) |
| 5 | -0.05 (1.37) |
| 6 | -0.62 (1.36) |
| 7 | -0.87 (1.37) |
| 8 | -0.63 (1.38) |
| 9 | -0.22 (1.37) |
| 10 | 0.93 (1.37) |
| 11 | -0.85 (1.37) |
| 12 | -0.62 (1.37) |
| 13 | -0.11 (1.37) |
| 14 | 0.56 (1.37) |
| 15 | -0.45 (1.38) |
| 16 | -0.56 (1.38) |
| 17 | 0.16 (1.36) |
| 18 | 0.53 (1.36) |
| 19 | 0.80 (1.36) |
| 20 | -0.18 (1.35) |
| 21 | -0.26 (1.35) |
| 22 | -0.15 (1.35) |
| 23 | -0.07 (1.35) |
| 24 | 0.11 (1.35) |
| 25 | 0.003 (1.35) |
| 26 | 0.0005 (1.35) |
| 27 | 0.17 (1.35) |
| 28 | 0.63 (1.35) |
| 29 | 0.44 (1.35) |
| 30 | 0.03 (1.35) |
| 31 | -0.04 (1.36) |
| 32 | -0.16 (1.35) |
| 33 | 0.23 (1.36) |
| 34 | 0.49 (1.36) |
| 35 | -0.14 (1.36) |
| 36 | -0.03 (1.36) |
| 37 | 0.60 (1.42) |
| 38 | 0.22 (1.40) |
| 39 | 0.58 (1.43) |
| 40 | 0.13 (1.40) |
| 41 | 0.16 (1.39) |
| 42 | 0.37 (1.42) |
| 43 | -2.30 (1.71) |
| 44 | 0.61 (1.41) |
| 45 | 0.32 (1.42) |
| 46 | -0.09 (1.39) |
| 47 | 0.16 (1.40) |
| 48 | -0.32 (1.42) |
| 49 | -0.04 (1.46) |
| 50 | 0.12 (1.41) |
| 51 | -1.02 (1.43) |
| 52 | 0.61 (1.39) |
| 53 | -0.50 (1.44) |
| 54 | 0.008 (1.41) |
| 55 | -0.63 (1.39) |
| 56 | 0.98 (1.39) |
| 57 | -0.53 (1.62) |
| 58 | -0.32 (1.43) |
| 59 | 1.12 (1.40) |
| 60 | -0.33 (1.43) |
| 61 | 0.02 (1.41) |
| 62 | 0.04 (1.41) |
| 63 | -1.59 (1.56) |
| 64 | -1.11 (1.43) |
| 65 | 0.29 (1.41) |
| 66 | -0.55 (1.41) |
| 67 | 0.22 (1.41) |
| 68 | 0.42 (1.43) |
| 69 | 0.55 (1.42) |
| 70 | -0.56 (1.39) |
| 71 | -16.47 (2728.30) |
| 72 | -0.83 (1.61) |
| 73 | 0.24 (1.46) |
| 74 | -0.47 (1.61) |
| 75 | -16.68 (3342.23) |
| 76 | -1.48 (1.56) |
| 77 | 0.16 (1.52) |
| 78 | -17.05 (3319.97) |
| 79 | 1.12 (1.40) |
| 80 | -0.90 (1.44) |
| 81 | -0.40 (1.45) |
| 82 | 0.52 (1.43) |
| 84 | -17.21 (4726.62) |
| 85 | 0.77 (1.48) |
| Location-FE | √ |
| N | 12,885 |

1. **Examples of Academics and Professionals Conveying Proposals Related to Academic Research/Professional Knowledge in Province 1 in 2005[[8]](#footnote-8)**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Position** | **Title of Proposal** | **Province** | **Year** |
| Professor in Department of Economics | Promote the development of circular economy and industrialization of the province with the sugar industry and paper industry as a pilot. | 1 | 2005 |
| Associate Professor in Department of Tourism Management | Suggestions on the establishment of the "Provincial Tourism Special Zone". | 1 | 2005 |
| Director of Inspection Center of Provincial Maternity and Child Health Hospital | Pay attention to medical check-up fees and high pricing. | 1 | 2005 |
| Director of the School of Geography and Tourism | Suggestions on vigorously promoting knowledge of sudden natural disasters such as earthquakes and  earthquake tsunami | 1 | 2005 |
| Dean of School of Humanities and Languages | About the protection of the province’s cultural and educational history | 1 | 2005 |
| Chief Physician of Spine Surgery, Provincial People's Hospital | Suggestions for setting up a traffic accident rescue fund | 1 | 2005 |
| Director of the Emergency Center of Provincial People’s Hospital | Suggestions on supplementing emergency medical expenses for basic medical insurance for urban employees | 1 | 2005 |
| Director of the Department of Urology, Municipal People's Hospital | Suggestions on establishing an emergency medical treatment and insurance system for migrant workers | 1 | 2005 |
| Lecturer in School of Humanities | Integrate the historical accumulation around the provincial capital and promote the transformation of the provincial capital into a tourist base | 1 | 2005 |
| Professor in School of Art | Recommendations on Coordinating and Implementing the "Opinions on the Reform of the Personnel System of Professional Art Performance Troupes Directly Directed by Province" | 1 | 2005 |
| Professor in Department of Music | Proposal for the construction of "Provincial Stage Art Project" | 1 | 2005 |
| Researcher at Chinese Academy of Medical Sciences | Suggestions of mining ethnic folk medicine and its resources in our province as soon as possible | 1 | 2005 |
| Associate Professor at Agricultural University | Suggestions on attaching importance to and solving the problem of land contracting for farmers in District | 1 | 2005 |
| Provincial Windsurfing Coach | Suggestions on Implementing the Problem of Land Use for Provincial Sports Center Construction | 1 | 2005 |
| Dean of School of Pharmacy | Suggestions on formulating the "Development Outline of Provincial Ecological Pharmaceutical Industry" | 1 | 2005 |
| Chief Physician of Provincial Center for Disease Control | Suggestions on increasing the proportion of medical insurance personal accounts | 1 | 2005 |
| Director of Department of Cardiology, Provincial Hospital of Traditional Chinese Medicine | Suggestions on resolving the funds for the construction of the outpatient ward complex of Provincial Hospital of Traditional Chinese Medicine as soon as possible | 1 | 2005 |
| Dean and Chief Physician of Provincial Hospital of Traditional Chinese Medicine | Suggestions on practically solving the "access" problem of Chinese and Western medical institutions in our province | 1 | 2005 |
| Lawyer | "Suggestions regarding the proper adjustment and resolution of disputes caused by the disparity in land use between farms and villages in ethnic areas in our province” | 1 | 2005 |

1. **Examples of Local Government Officials Conveying Local Concerns through Proposals in Province 2 in 2008**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Position** | **Title of Proposal** | **Province** | **Year** |
| Chairman of Municipal PPCC | Suggestions on River Flood Control | 2 | 2010 |
| Chairman of Municipal PPCC | A strong work promotion mechanism must be established for the construction of a demonstration zone for the transfer of industries in City X | 2 | 2010 |
| Chairman of Municipal PPCC | Suggestions on Speeding up the Construction of Municipal Economic Circle | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Mayor | Proposal on Vigorously Strengthening Aviation Tourism in Area X | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Director of Municipal Audit Bureau | Make full use of the golden waterways of the River X to transform City X into the provincial shipping center | 2 | 2010 |
| Vice-Chairman of Municipal PPCC | Suggestions on the Provincial Finance Department to Increase the Funds Input for the Reconstruction of Dilapidated Rural Houses in City X | 2 | 2010 |
| Vice-Chairman of the Municipal PPCC, Director of the Municipal Science and Technology Bureau | Proposals for upgrading the Municipal High-tech Industrial Development Zone to a Provincial Development Zone | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Chief of District Government | Proposal on Establishing "Municipal Industrial Transfer Pilot Zone" | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Party Secretary and Head of Township | Suggestions on Implementing Regional Tourism Cooperation and Promoting the Integrated Construction of Regional Tourism | 2 | 2010 |
| Director of Vehicle Management Office, Urban Management Bureau | Regarding the establishment of roadside houses around major and minor roads in City X | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Director of the Municipal Cultural Bureau | Suggestions on further attaching importance to the development of tourism of City X | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Director Municipal Planning Bureau | Suggestions on strengthening the construction of the ecological environment and promoting the healthy and sustainable development of the City X Belt undertaking industrial transfer demonstration | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Director of the Taiwan Affairs Office of County X | Proposal on requesting the construction of the second Bridge in City X | 2 | 2010 |
| Director of the Education and Sports Bureau of County X | Suggestions on rectifying the phenomenon of illegal soliciting and lodging in the square in front of the Municipal Railway Station | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy County Mayor of County X | Proposal on requesting the dredging of the upper reaches of River X | 2 | 2010 |
| Director of Municipal Health Bureau | Strengthen the market management of agricultural and sideline products and enhance the image of a civilized and sanitary city | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Mayor | Suggestions on further improving measures and accelerating the development of some cities and counties in North of Province and along River X | 2 | 2010 |
| Vice-Chairman of Municipal PPCC and Minister of the United Front Work Department | Mobilize various forces around Lake X to implement pollution prevention and control linkage | 2 | 2010 |
| Chairman of Municipal PPCC | Suggestions on Speeding up the Construction of Section X of Expressway X | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Secretary of the Municipal Party Committee and Chairman of the Municipal PPCC | In order to promote the transformation of City X as resource-based city and strengthen City X’s endurance to make more contributions to the province's economic development, it is recommended that the provincial government increase relevant policies and financial support | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Director of Municipal Quality and Technical Supervision Bureau | Proposal for planning the City X-City Y Intercity Railway | 2 | 2010 |
| Deputy Mayor | Speeding up the construction of City X’s International Tourism and Cultural Demonstration Zone | 2 | 2010 |

1. **Number of Proposals submitted to PPCCs in Provinces 1 and 2**

Chart, bar chart

Description automatically generated

Source: Compiled by author

1. Log GDP per capita in 2019, National Bureau of Statistics [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Log Population in 2019, National Bureau of Statistics [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Log Area in km², National Bureau of Statistics [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Ratio of urban population in percent of overall population in province in 2019, National Bureau of Statistics [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Party members per 10,000 citizens in 2010, taken from Koss (2018:23) [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Number of proposals submitted in 2019 divided by number of delegates. Data taken from Provincial PPCC’s annual work reports. 2019 is the year with most data available across provinces. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Number of proposals filed in 2019 divided by number of delegates. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Including all relevant examples for Tables 14 and 15 would go beyond the scope of this appendix. I have therefore only highlighted relevant examples from one province in one particular year in each table. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)