

## Appendix 2

### “Anarchy” in Post-WWII IR (1946-1978)

Occurrences of “anarchy” and “anarchic” in books published between 1946 and 1978.

All electronically available passages° are quoted from books with less than twenty occurrences.

Books	Occurrences	(Mean: 6.0. Median: 2)
Hans J. Morgenthau (1946), <i>Scientific Man Versus Power Politics</i> .	1	“order under law’ as an alternative to the international anarchy of our age is reasonable only under the assumption that the international sphere already contains the social elements making for order and peace.” (117)
Martin Wight (1978 [1946]), <i>Power Politics</i> .	11	[title in footnote]; (86) “International Anarchy” [chapter title]; (100) “the international scene is properly described as an anarchy;” (101) all particular causes of war operate within the context of international anarchy;” (102) “best described as ‘international anarchy;” (105) international law establishes “a standard to which international anarchy should conform;” (109) “the alternatives to the balance of power are either universal anarchy or universal dominion;” (184) “the right of individual self-defence is the basic principle of international anarchy;” (218) “the international anarchy is restrained” by certain common interests; (289) “the world community is still an anarchy;” (293) [index entry] (305)
Grayson L. Kirk (1947), <i>The Study of International Relations in American Colleges and Universities</i> .	0	
Hans J. Morgenthau (1948), <i>Politics Among Nations: The Struggle for Power and Peace</i> .	10	“the horrors of disorder and anarchy;” (138) “to make relations between nations more peaceful and less anarchic;” (174) “if anarchy and violence are not to be the order of the day;” (210) “war and international anarchy;” (310, 361) “international anarchy and war;” (311) “abstract principles of justice ... actually strengthened international anarchy by strengthening the antagonistic policies of individual nations;” (378) “order and anarchy, peace and war;” (431) [bibliography entries]. (485, 487)
Herbert Butterfield (1950), <i>Christianity and History</i> .	2	“sheer ungovernable anarchy;” (34) “problems of anarchy, disunity and external danger.” (63)
Frederick S. Dunn (1950), <i>War and the Minds of Men</i> .	0	
Wolfgang Friedmann (1951), <i>An Introduction to World Politics</i> .	3	“sink into anarchy;” (191) “economic anarchy;” (248) “anarchy and economic disaster.” (273)
George F. Kennan (1951), <i>American Diplomacy, 1900-1950</i> .	2	“disorder and anarchy” in China; (33) “the lurid fascination that manifestations of danger and anarchy always exert.” (149)
Hans J. Morgenthau (1951), <i>In Defense of the National Interest: A Critical Examination of American Foreign Policy</i> .	2	“peace, law, and order vs. aggression, crime, and anarchy;” (102) “a long period of anarchy” in China. (203)
Dexter Perkins (1952), <i>The American Approach to Foreign Policy</i>	0	
Karl W. Deutsch (1953), <i>Nationalism and Social Communication: An Inquiry into the Foundations of Nationality</i> .	0	
Frank Tannenbaum (1955), <i>The American Tradition in Foreign Policy</i> .	0	
Karl W. Deutsch (1957), <i>Political Community and the North Atlantic Area: International Organization in the Light</i>	1	“another popular notion is that a principal motive for the political integration of states has been the fear of anarchy, as well as warfare among them.” (25)

<i>of Historical Experience.</i>		
Morton A. Kaplan (1957), <i>System and Process in International Politics.</i>	2	bipolar war leads to “a hierarchical international system if one side wins or international anarchy if both sides are exhausted. Almost any kind of system may replace this state of anarchy;” (49) threats to bureaucratic hierarchy “may stir the fear that anarchy may result.” (147)
Henry A. Kissinger (1957), <i>A World Restored: Metternich, Castlereagh and the Problems of Peace, 1812-22.</i>	2	“a Europe of universal anarchy” [quoting Metternich’s fear of Napoleon]. (17, 25)
A. F. K. Organski (1958), <i>World Politics.</i>	0	
Bernard Brodie (1959), <i>Strategy in the Missile Age.</i>	0	
William T. R. Fox (1959), <i>Theoretical Aspects of International Relations</i>	4	citation of Dickinson 1916; (60) “some democratic states ... offer to the world a picture of near-anarchy;” (102) “principle made for either anarchy or tyranny, as it did in the French Revolution.” (113)
John H. Herz (1959), <i>International Politics in the Atomic Age.</i>	13	proliferation leading to “anarchy and limitless violence” [quoting Morgenthau]; (35) “insecurity (‘international anarchy’);” (39) “‘anarchic’ because ... devoid of higher, that is, supranational authority;” (39) “international anarchy” and “collective security” compared and contrasted; (40) “international anarchy, or balance of power, or power politics;” (42) “the anarchy of feudal jurisdictions;” (43) medieval “age of anarchy and insecurity;” (44) “an ‘anarchic’ international system;” (54 n10) “without such agreed upon standards and rules [of sovereign jurisdiction] real ‘anarchy’ would prevail;” (59-60) “a basically anarchic environment;” (62) territorial community contrasted to “outside ‘anarchy’ where the law of nature reigned and no standards of civilization prevailed;” (67) with bipolar deterrence only outside the blocs “would the realm of a new-style ‘anarchy’ prevail;” (203) “the security dilemma in which power units find themselves in all ‘anarchic’ societies.” (272-273)
Kenneth N. Waltz (1959), <i>Man, the State and War: A Theoretical Analysis.</i>	39	
Anatol Rapoport (1960), <i>Fights, Games, and Debates.</i>	0	
Lewis F. Richardson (1960), <i>Arms and Insecurity: A Mathematical Study of the Causes and Origins of War.</i>	0	
Thomas C. Schelling (1960), <i>Strategy of Conflict.</i>	1	“in times of anarchy or political conflict.” (74)
James N. Rosenau (ed.) (1961), <i>International Politics and Foreign Policy: A Reader in Research and Theory</i>	8	“the essential anarchy that prevails in the relations between states;” (9) “the modern states system, has been considered ‘anarchic,’ because it was based on unequally distributed power and it was deficient in higher – that is supra-national – power;” (80) “‘feudal anarchy’ of jurisdictions yield to the ordered centralism of the absolute monarchy;” (81) “anarchy, where the law of nature reigned and no standards of civilization applied;” (83) “the fear that anarchy would result if each decision maker ...;” (168) “it would of course be anarchic if different policies were substituted at each hierarchic level;” (168) “an anarchic demand for abolition of all bounds and limitations.” (305)
Glenn H. Snyder (1961), <i>Deterrence and Defense: Toward a Theory of National Security.</i>	0	
Kenneth E. Boulding (1962), <i>Conflict and Defense: A General Theory.</i>	1	“two extreme positions, which we might stigmatize as anarchy on the one hand and tyranny on the other.” (187)
Inis Claude (1962), <i>Power and International Relations</i>	16	“A balance of power is in fact a kind of managed anarchy. But it is a system in which the anarchy invariably overcomes the management in the end;” (79) advocates of world government argue that “the world is in a state of anarchy;” (210) “in relations among nations complete anarchy still prevails” [quoting Einstein]; (210) “the characterization of the present-day world as a congeries of fully sovereign states existing in wholly anarchical relationship[s]” reveals the absence of “any serious ... study of international relations;” (210-211) “would make a prudent scholar hesitate to proclaim that unmitigated anarchy prevails in the twentieth-century world;” (211) Einstein “did not establish the fact of anarchy and demonstrate the derivation of the world’s troubles from that fact, but he noted the troubles and assumed that their existence indicated a state of anarchy;” (211) talk of anarchy, however, “is typically the product not of ignorance, but of strong conviction;” (212) “the champions of world government who cry anarchy;” (212) they argue that “short of world government, one finds only varying forms of anarchy;” (212) “anarchy is a symbol of peril – the peril of uncontrollable

		disorder;" (212) the underlying reasoning is "that in the absence of government we have anarchy, and that anarchy, by definition, implies disorder;" (213) "these observations are not intended to suggest the general conclusion that anarchy is more productive of peace and order than is government. ... [but] peace without government" is not an infrequent occurrence;" (215) "anarchy – disorder, insecurity, violence, injustice;" (260) [index entry] . (301)
Arnold Wolfers (1962), <i>Discord and Collaboration: Essays on International Politics</i> .	4	"some democratic states have exhibited such pluralistic tendencies that they offer to the world a picture of near-anarchy;" (21) "the social vacuum of absolute anarchy;"(53) "world tyranny or world anarchy;" (64) "the objectionable features we attribute to international anarchy." (240)
F. H. Hinsley (1963), <i>Power and the Pursuit of Peace: Theory and Practice in the History of Relations Between States</i> .	9	"the problem of international anarchy;" (52) [quoting Kant] "the resulting soulless despotism is plunged into anarchy;" (78) [quoting Mazzini] "avoiding alike the anarchy of absolute independence and the centralisation of conquest;" (113) "the war raged against the Revolution had the logical consequence of the prevailing anarchy;" (186) after the French Revolution many felt that "Europe was in the state of complete anarchy;" (189) re: Concert, "the relevant question is why the Great Powers did not ... return to the anarchy of the eighteenth century;" (220) [quoting A. J. P. Taylor] "'international anarchy' makes war possible; it does not make it certain;" (323) "international anarchy – in the sense of the existence of separate sovereign states." (326, 327)
Ernst B. Haas (1964), <i>Beyond the Nation State: Functionalism and International Organization</i> .	0	
J. W. Burton (1965), <i>International Relations: A General Theory</i>	7	[section heading]; (45) "insecurity ('international anarchy') ruled supreme; (116); [index entry] . (281)
Stanley Hoffmann (1965), <i>The State of War: Essays on the Theory and Practice of International Relations</i> .	2	"the problem of international 'anarchy';" (71) "the earlier violence was still anarchic and mild enough to be overcome by such reasoning;" (73)
Harold Sprout and Margaret Sprout (1965), <i>The Ecological Perspective on Human Affairs: With Special Reference to International Politics</i> .	0	
Raymond Aron (2003 [1966]), <i>Peace and War: A Theory of International Relations</i> .	11	"apparent anarchy within the democracies;" (65) "when relations have not been merely occasional and anarchic;" (95) "encouraging international anarchy;" (122) "if not immoral, at least anarchic;" (128) "Bolshevik Russia collapses into anarchy;" (199) "seized weak or anarchic nations;" (273) "all the degrees of anarchy or organization;" (327) "relapse into tribal anarchy;" (376) "bloody anarchy;" (377) "encouraged international anarchy;" (720); a strong "desire for autonomy ... implies an element of international anarchy." (724)
Herbert Butterfield and Martin Wight (1966), <i>Diplomatic Investigations: Essays in the Theory of International Politics</i> .	31	
Charles A. McClelland (1966), <i>Theory and the International System</i> .	0	
Robert E. Osgood and Robert W. Tucker (1967), <i>Force, Order, and Justice</i> .	2	"force must be as essential to international politics in an anarchy as elections are to domestic politics in an organized democracy;" (13) "an international politics that is all too near anarchy to afford much scope for ... pacification." (184)
J. David Singer (ed.) (1968), <i>Quantitative International Politics: Insights and Evidence</i> .	0	
Hans J. Morgenthau (1970), <i>Truth and Power: Essays of a Decade, 1960-70</i> .	6	"violent anarchy on the part of those groups;" (7) "anarchy, a large-scale and unmanageable breakdown of law and order;" (211) "that anarchic violence that already terrorizes many of our streets and schools;" (211) "the anarchy of a war of all against all" between branches of the government; (268) "not life and civilization but anarchy and universal destruction." (274)

James N. Rosenau (1971), <i>The Scientific Study of Foreign Policy</i> .	0	
John W. Burton (1972), <i>World Society</i> .	0	
Robert O. Keohane and Joseph S. Nye (1972), <i>Transnational Relations and World Politics</i> .	1	“theories of power politics characterizing an ‘anarchic international system’.” (47)
Bryan Porter (ed.) (1972), <i>The Aberystwyth Papers: International Politics 1919-1969</i> .	13	realists “drew attention to the reality of conflict and anarchy;” (36) “stateless or anarchic polities; e.g., the old tribal society;” (72) “it seemed as if the anarchy of the Thirty Years’ War had come again;” (141) “undisciplined reprisals seemed likely to convert into complete anarchy.” (142)
Bernard Brodie (1973), <i>War and Politics</i> .	0	
John J. Weltman (1973), <i>Systems Theory in International Relations: A Study in Metaphoric Hypertrophy</i> .	1	[]. (1)
Richard Falk (1975), <i>A Study of Future Worlds</i> .	2	“the highly dispersed nexus of power/authority that is world feudalism or world anarchy;” (201) “violent anarchy.” (449)
Robert Gilpin (1975), <i>U.S. Power and the Multinational Corporation: The Political Economy of Direct Foreign Investment</i> .	0	
Nelson W. Polsby and Fred I. Greenstein (1975), <i>Handbook of Political Science, Volume 8: International Politics</i> .	11	“international anarchy has endured;” (35) “international systems are decentralized or anarchic;” (46) “the outcome of units’ behavior under conditions of anarchy;” (63) “the international system changes if its anarchic character gives way;” (65) “so long as none of the units is able to convert the anarchic international realm into a hierarchic one;” (68) “the enduring anarchic character of international relations;” (68) “others have argued that the most important source of insecurity is the anarchy that rules the relations of the world’s many nations;” (250) “closed anarchic system;” (250) “what Waltz describes as ‘international anarchy;’”(363) [index entry]. (437)
Robert Jervis (1976), <i>Perception and Misperception in International Politics</i> .	10	“the anarchic nature of the international system;” (20, 83) “the anarchic setting of international relations;” (62) “whether anarchy produces the unfortunate effects we are discussing;” (63) “the argument sketched so far rests on the implications of anarchy;” (67) “the consequences of international anarchy;” (68) “a setting of anarchy;” (75) “the anarchic context of international relations;” (76) “the implications of international anarchy;” (273) “an environment of anarchy.” (340)
Immanuel Wallerstein (2011 [1976]), <i>The Modern World-System: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century</i> .	3	“the European situation well could have collapsed into constant anarchy;” (38) “the princes ... raised Germany out of its inherited anarchy;” (177) “prevents real anarchy even in the days of civil war.” (233).
Hedley Bull (1977), <i>The Anarchical Society: A Study of Order in World Politics</i> .	100+‡	
Robert O. Keohane and Joseph S. Nye (1977), <i>Power and Interdependence: World Politics in Transition</i> .	0	
Stephen D. Krasner (1978), <i>Defending the National Interest: Raw Materials Investments and U.S. Policy</i> .	2	“the nature of the international system, its inherent anarchy;” (17) “the imperative imposed by the anarchy of the international system.” (345)

‡ Searching for “anarchy,” “anarchic,” and “anarchical” (which is by far Bull’s most common formulation). Google Books “Preview” only shows 100 occurrences.

◦ Missing passages are due to the fact that Google Books' "Snippet View" shows only three pages in which the searched term appears (although searching multiple formats sometimes reveals additional passages).