

## Appendix 5: Twenty Common Definitions of “Anarchy”

Anarchy is regularly defined in contemporary IR as the absence of

government	(Waltz 1979: 88, 114), (Axelrod and Keohane 1985: 226), (Ferguson and Mansbach 1999: 82), (Art 2003, 4), (Linklater 2010, 2).
a government	(Kim 1993, 58), (Kay 2004, 255), (Eckert 2006, 852; Kim 1993), (Cutler 2011, 47), (Staton and Moore 2011, 559)
a sovereign	(Posen 1993: 27), (Schweller 1998: 51), (Jervis 1999: 43), (Taliaferro 2000/2001, 128), (Bignami 2004, 101 n12).
a common authority	(Jonsson and Tallberg 1998, 379), (Lake 2003c, 308), (Goddard and Nexon 2005, 12), (Paris 2006, 435), (Jackson and Nexon 2009, 923).
a higher authority	(Raymond 1997, 208), (Dombrowski 1998, 21), (Rosenau and Durfee 2000, 17), (Philpott 2001, 18), (Johnson 2004: 187).
a central authority	(Jervis 1992: 717), (Mearsheimer 2001: 3), (Snyder 2002: 35), (Kegley and Raymond 2011, 26), (Zhang 2012, 91).
an overarching authority	(Elman and Elman 1997, 924), (Schmidt 2004, 430), (Goh 2008, 356), (Trachtenberg 2012, 44), (Mandel 2013, 62).
an enforcer	(Booth 1991, 529), (Philpott 2001, 22), (Crawford 2002, 418), (Lake 2003a, 85), (Miller 2004: 240).
enforcement	(Keohane 1990, 193), (Cederman 1994, 504 n. 2), (Koremenos, Lipson, and Snidal 2001: 766), (Snyder 2002, 14), (Mitzen 2013, 46).
common authority	(Keohane 1986, 1), (Christov 2005, 564), (Goodhart 2005, 56), (Guzzini 2012, 33), (Amstutz 2013, 13).
higher authority	(Krasner 1992: 39), (Powell 1994, 330), (Rosenau 1997, 151), (Angstrom 2000, 33), (Mansbach 2004, 20).
overarching authority	(Buzan 1984: 112, 116), (Grieco 1988, 497), (Snyder 2002, 7 n2), (Bromley 2004, 108), (Bickerton, Cunliffe, and Gourevitch 2007a, 2).
central authority	(Lynn-Jones and Miller 1995, ix), (Cronin 1999: 136), (Mearsheimer 2001, 414 n. 5), (Snyder 2002: 34), (Harknett and Yalcin 2012, 508).
superior authority	(Powell 1991, 1306), (Bartelson 1995, 257), (Stivachtis 2000, 102), (Snyder 2002, 7 n2), (van Ham and Medvedev 2002, 129).
superordinate authority	(Haas 1991, 225), (Weinert 2007, 6), (Nardin 2008, 387), (Davenport 2013, 33), (Scheider and Spindler 2014, 6)
any higher authority	(Rosenau 1997, 64), (Lake 2003a, 84), (Friedberg 2005, 17), (Vinci 2008, 295), (Copeland 2012, 59).
any supranational authority	(Mansfield 1993, 107), (Gowa 1994, 6), (Glenn 2009, 532), (Geldenhuis 2014, 354), (Wagner 2014, 107).
any central authority	(Bull 1977, 58), (Jakobsen 1999, 208), (Hartzell 1999, 5), (Duffield 2001, 96 n. 2), (Bickerton, Cunliffe, and Gourevitch 2007b, 25).
any overarching authority	(Mandelbaum 1998-1999, 26), (Kahler and Lake 2004, 409), (Haubrich 2006, 84), (Kitchen 2010, 121), (Druzin 2014, 452).

authority [ <i>simpliciter</i> ]	(Krasner 1992, 48), (Katzenstein, Keohane, and Krasner 1999, 658), (Inoguchi and Bacon 2001, 5), (Lake 2009, ix), (Polat 2012, 1).
hierarchy	(Waltz 1979, 93, 97, 100, 101), (Berejikian 1997, 789 n3), (Deudney and Ikenberry 1999, 187), (Stivachtis 2000, 101), (Mearsheimer 2002, 25)

- Amstutz, Mark R. 2013. *International Ethics: Concepts, Theories, and Cases in Global Politics*. 4th ed. Lanham: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Angstrom, Jan. 2000. "The Sociology of Studies of Ethnic Conflict: Explaining the Causal Status of Development." *Civil Wars* 3 (3):23-44.
- Art, Robert J. 2003. *A Grand Strategy for America*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Axelrod, Robert and Robert O. Keohane. 1985. "Achieving Cooperation under Anarchy: Strategies and Institutions." *World Politics* 38 (1):226-254.
- Bartelson, Jens. 1995. "The Trial of Judgment: A Note on Kant and the Paradoxes of Internationalism." *International Studies Quarterly* 39 (2):255-279.
- Berejikian, Jeffrey D. 1997. "The Gains Debate: Framing State Choice." *American Political Science Review* 91 (4):December.
- Bickerton, Christopher J., Philip Cunliffe, and Alexander Gourevitch. 2007a. "Introduction: The Unholy Alliance Against Sovereignty." In *Politics Without Sovereignty: A Critique of Contemporary International Relations*, edited by Christopher J. Bickerton, Philip Cunliffe and Alexander Gourevitch. Abingdon: UCL Press/Taylor & Francis.
- Bickerton, Christopher J., Philip Cunliffe, and Alexander Gourevitch. 2007b. "Politics Without Sovereignty?" In *Politics Without Sovereignty: A Critique of Contemporary International Relations*, edited by Christopher J. Bickerton, Philip Cunliffe and Alexander Gourevitch. Abingdon: UCL Press/Taylor & Francis.
- Bignami, Francesca. 2004. "The Challenge of Cooperative Regulatory Relations after Enlargement." In *Law and Governance in an Enlarged European Union*, edited by George A. Bermann and Katharina Pistor. Oxford: Hart Publishing.
- Booth, Ken. 1991. "Security in Anarchy: Utopian Realism in Theory and Practice." *International Affairs* 67 (3):527-545.
- Bromley, Simon. 2004. "International Politics: States, Anarchy, and Governance." In *Making the International: Economic Interdependence and Political Order*, edited by Simon Bromley, Maureen Mackintosh and William Brown. London: Pluto Press.
- Bull, Hedley. 1977. *The Anarchical Society: A Study of Order in World Politics*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Buzan, Barry. 1984. "Peace, Power, and Security: Contending Concepts in the Study of International Relations." *Journal of Peace Research* 21 (2):109-125.
- Cederman, Lars-Erik. 1994. "Emergent Polarity: Analyzing State-Formation and Power Politics." *International Studies Quarterly* 38 (4):501-533.
- Christov, Theodore. 2005. "Liberal Internationalism Revisited: Grotius, Vattel, and the International Order of States." *The European Legacy: Toward New Paradigms* 10 (6):561-584.
- Copeland, Dale. 2012. "Realism and Neorealism in the Study of Regional Conflict." In *International Relations Theory and Regional Transformation*, edited by T. V. Paul. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Crawford, Neta. 2002. *Argument and Change in World Politics: Ethics, Decolonization, and Humanitarian Intervention*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cronin, Bruce. 1999. *Community under Anarchy: Transnational Identity and the Evolution of Cooperation*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Cutler, A. Claire. 2011. "The Privatization of Authority in the Global Political Economy." In *Relations of Global Power: Neoliberal Order and Disorder*, edited by Stephen McBride and Gary Teeple. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Davenport, Andrew. 2013. "Marxism in IR: Condemned to a Realist Fate?" *European Journal of International Relations* 19 (1):27-48.
- Deudney, Daniel and G. John Ikenberry. 1999. "The Nature and Sources of Liberal International Order." *Review of International Studies* 25 (2):179-196.
- Dombrowski, Peter. 1998. "Haute Finance and High Theory: Recent Scholarship on Global Financial Relations." *Mershon International Studies Review* 42 (1):1-28.
- Druzin, Bryan H. 2014. "Opening the Machinery of Private Order: Public International Law as a Form of Private Ordering." *Saint Louis University Law Journal* 58 (2):423-466.

- Duffield, John S. 2001. "Transatlantic Relations after the Cold War: Theory, Evidence, and the Future." *International Studies Perspectives* 2 (1):93-115.
- Eckert, Amy E. 2006. "Peoples and Persons: Moral Standing, Power, and the Equality of States." *International Studies Quarterly* 50 (4):841-860.
- Elman, Colin and Miriam Fendius Elman. 1997. "Lakatos and Neorealism: A Reply to Vasquez." *American Political Science Review* 91 (4):923-926.
- Ferguson, Yale H. and Richard W. Mansbach. 1999. "Global Politics at the Turn of the Millennium: Changing Bases of 'Us' and 'Them'." *International Studies Review* 1 (2):77-107.
- Friedberg, Aaron L. 2005. "The Future of U.S.-China Relations: Is Conflict Inevitable?" *International Security* 30 (2):7-45.
- Geldenhuis, Deon. 2014. "The African Union, Responsible Sovereignty, and Contested States." *Global Responsibility to Protect* 6 (3):350-374.
- Glenn, John. 2009. "Realism versus Strategic Culture: Competition and Collaboration?" *International Studies Review* 11 (3):523-551.
- Goddard, Stacie E. and Daniel H. Nexon. 2005. "Paradigm Lost? Reassessing *Theory of International Politics*." *European Journal of International Relations* 11 (1):9-61.
- Goh, Evelyn. 2008. "Hierarchy and the Role of the United States in the East Asian Security Order." *International Relations of the Asia-Pacific* 8 (3):353-377.
- Goodhart, Michael. 2005. *Democracy as Human Rights: Freedom and Equality in the Age of Globalization*. New York: Routledge.
- Gowa, Joanne. 1994. *Allies, Adversaries, and International Trade*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Grieco, Joseph M. 1988. "Anarchy and the Limits of Cooperation: A Realist Critique of the Newest Liberal Institutionalism." *International Organization* 42 (3):485-507.
- Guzzini, Stefano. 2012. "Which Geopolitics?" In *The Return of Geopolitics in Europe?: Social Mechanisms and Foreign Policy Identity Crises*, edited by Stefano Guzzini. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Haas, Peter M. 1991. "Policy Responses to Stratospheric Ozone Depletion." *Global Environmental Change* 1 (3):224-234.
- Harknett, Richard J. and Hasan B. Yalcin. 2012. "The Struggle for Autonomy: A Realist Structural Theory of International Relations." *International Studies Review* 14 (4):499-521.
- Hartzell, Caroline A. 1999. "Explaining the Stability of Negotiated Settlements to Intrastate Wars." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 43 (1):3-22.
- Haubrich, Dirk. 2006. "The Foreign v. the Domestic after September 11th: The Methodology of Political Analysis Revisited." *Politics* 26 (2):84-92.
- Inoguchi, Takashi and Paul Bacon. 2001. "The Study of International Relations in Japan: Towards a More International Discipline." *International Relations of the Asia-Pacific* 1 (1):1-20.
- Jackson, Patrick Thaddeus and Daniel H. Nexon. 2009. "Pragmatic Faults in International-Relations Theory." *International Studies Review* 53 (4):907-930.
- Jakobsen, Susanne. 1999. "International Relations and Global Environmental Change: Review of the Burgeoning Literature on the Environment." *Cooperation and Conflict* 34 (2):205-236.
- Jervis, Robert. 1992. "A Political Science Perspective on the Balance of Power and the Concert." *American Historical Review* 97 (3):716-724.
- Jervis, Robert. 1999. "Realism, Neoliberalism, and Cooperation: Understanding the Debate." *International Security* 24 (1):42-63.
- Johnson, Dominic D. P. 2004. *Overconfidence and War: The Havoc and Glory of Positive Illusions*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Jonsson, Christer and Jonas Tallberg. 1998. "Compliance and Post-Agreement Bargaining." *European Journal of International Relations* 4 (4):371-408.
- Kahler, Miles and David A. Lake. 2004. "Governance in a Global Economy: Political Authority in Transition." *PS: Political Science and Politics* 37 (3):409-414.
- Katzenstein, Peter J., Robert O. Keohane, and Stephen D. Krasner. 1999. "*International Organization* and the Study of World Politics." *International Organization* 52 (4):645-685.
- Kay, Sean. 2004. "NATO, the Kosovo War and Neoliberal Theory." *Contemporary Security Policy* 25 (2):252-279.

- Kegley, Charles W. and Gregory A. Raymond. 2011. *The Global Future: A Brief Introduction to World Politics*. 4th ed. Boston: Wadsworth/Cengage Learning.
- Keohane, Robert O. 1986. "Reciprocity in International Relations." *International Organization* 40 (1):1-27.
- Keohane, Robert O. 1990. "Correspondence." *International Security* 15 (2):192-194.
- Kim, Samuel S. 1993. "In Search of Global Constitutionalism." In *The Constitutional Foundations of World Peace: Logic and Tinkering*, edited by Richard A. Falk, Robert C. Johansen and Samuel S. Kim. Albany: SUNY Press.
- Kitchen, Nicholas. 2010. "Systemic Pressures and Domestic Ideas: A Neoclassical Realist Model of Grand Strategy Formation." *Review of International Studies* 36 (1):117.
- Koremenos, Barbara, Charles Lipson, and Duncan Snidal. 2001. "The Rational Design of International Institutions." *International Organization* 55 (4):761-799.
- Krasner, Stephen D. 1992. "Realism, Imperialism, and Democracy: A Response to Gilbert." *Political Theory* 20 (1):38-52.
- Lake, David A. 2003a. "International Relations Theory and Internal Conflict: Insights from the Interstices." *International Studies Review* 5 (4):81-90.
- Lake, David A. 2003c. "The New Sovereignty in International Relations." *International Studies Review* 5 (3):303-323.
- Linklater, Andrew. 2010. "The English School Conception of International Society: Reflections on Western and non-Western Perspectives." *Ritsumeikan Annual Review of International Studies* 9:1-13.
- Lynn-Jones, Sean M. and Steven E. Miller. 1995. "Preface." In *The Perils of Anarchy: Contemporary Realism and International Security*, edited by Michael E. Brown, Sean M. Lynn-Jones and Steven E. Miller. Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Mandel, Robert. 2013. *Global Security Upheaval: Armed Nonstate Groups Usurping State Stability Functions*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Mandelbaum, Michael. 1998-1999. "Is Major War Obsolete?" *Survival* 40 (4):20-38.
- Mansbach, Richard W. 2004. "The Meaning of 11 September and the Emerging Postinternational World." In *11 September and its Aftermath: The Geopolitics of Terror*, edited by Stanley D. Brunn. London: Frank Cass.
- Mansfield, Edward D. 1993. "Concentration, Polarity, and the Distribution of Power." *International Studies Quarterly* 37 (1):105-128.
- Mearsheimer, John J. 2001. *The Tragedy of Great Power Politics*. New York: Norton.
- Mearsheimer, John J. 2002. "Realism, the Real World, and the Academy." In *Realism and Institutionalism in International Studies*, edited by Michael Brecher and Frank P. Harvey. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Miller, Benjamin. 2004. "The International System and Regional Balance in the Middle East." In *Balance of Power: Theory and Practice in the 21st Century*, edited by T. V. Paul, James J. Wirtz and Michel Fortman. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Mitzen, Jennifer. 2013. *Power in Concert: The Nineteenth-Century Origins of Global Governance*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Nardin, Terry. 2008. "Theorising the International Rule of Law." *Review of International Studies* 34 (385-401).
- Paris, Roland. 2006. "Bringing the Leviathan Back In: Classical Versus Contemporary Studies of the Liberal Peace." *International Studies Review* 8 (3):425-440.
- Philpott, Daniel. 2001. *Revolutions in Sovereignty: How Ideas Shaped Modern International Relations*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Polat, Necati. 2012. *International Relations, Meaning and Mimesis*. Milton Park, Abingdon: Routledge.
- Posen, Barry R. 1993. "The Security Dilemma and Ethnic Conflict." *Survival* 35 (1):27-47.
- Powell, Robert. 1991. "Absolute and Relative Gains in International Relations Theory." *American Political Science Review* 85 (4):1303-1320.
- Powell, Robert. 1994. "Anarchy in International Relations Theory: The Neorealist-Neoliberal Debate." *International Organization* 48 (2):313-344.
- Raymond, Gregory A. 1997. "Problems and Prospects in the Study of International Norms." *International Studies Quarterly* 41 (Supplement no. 2):205-245.

- Rosenau, James N. 1997. *Along the Domestic-Foreign Frontier: Exploring Governance in a Turbulent World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Rosenau, James N. and Mary Durfee. 2000. *Thinking Theory Thoroughly: Coherent Approaches to an Incoherent World*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Scheider, Siegfried and Manuela Spindler. 2014. "Theory in International Relations." In *Theories of International Relations*, edited by Siegfried Scheider and Manuela Spindler. Milton Park Abingdon: Routledge.
- Schmidt, Brian C. 2004. "Realism as Tragedy." *Review of International Studies* 30 (3):427-441.
- Schweller, Randall L. 1998. *Deadly Imbalances: Tripolarity and Hitler's Strategy of World Conquest*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Snyder, Jack. 2002. "Anarchy and Culture: Insights from the Anthropology of War." *International Organization* 56 (1):7-45.
- Staton, Jeffrey K. and Will H. Moore. 2011. "Judicial Power in Domestic and International Politics." *International Organization* 65 (3):553-587.
- Stivachtis, Yannis A. 2000. "The International System and the Use of Weapons of Mass Destruction." *Journal of Strategic Studies* 23 (1):101-131.
- Taliaferro, Jeffrey W. 2000/2001. "Security Seeking Under Anarchy: Defensive Realism Revisited." *International Security* 25 (3):128-161.
- Trachtenberg, Marc. 2012. *The Cold War and After: History, Theory, and the Logic of International Politics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- van Ham, Peter and Sergei Medvedev. 2002. *Mapping European Security After Kosovo*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Vinci, Anthony. 2008. "Anarchy, Failed States, and Armed Groups: Reconsidering Conventional Analysis." *International Studies Quarterly* 52 (2):295-314.
- Wagner, Wolfgang. 2014. "International Relations Theories and Human Rights." In *The SAGE Handbook of Human Rights*, edited by Mark Gibney and Anja Mihr. London: SAGE Publications.
- Waltz, Kenneth N. 1979. *Theory of International Politics*. New York: Random House.
- Weinert, Matthew S. 2007. "Bridging the Human Rights – Sovereignty Divide: Theoretical Foundations of Democratic Sovereignty." *Human Rights Review* 8 (2):5-32.
- Zhang, Feng. 2012. "The Tsinghua Approach and the Inception of Chinese Theories of International Relations." *The Chinese Journal of International Politics* 5 (1):73-102.