**Supplemental Material: The Catholic Parishes and Muslim Associations**

**CATHOLIC PARISHES**

**Santa Maria alla Fontana, Milan, Italy**

This is the parish in which Silvio Berlusconi was baptized (he was not a billionaire at the time). The neighborhood, hemmed in by the Zara, Isola and Corso Como areas outside the tourist zones of Milan, is modest, comfortable, and a vibrant mix of Italians and immigrants. The parish has 14,000 parishioners, 2000 attend mass weekly. It has four priests, including one who is retired but who helps with functions. The volunteer groups include: Saint Vincent de Paul (SVdP, *San Vincento di Paolo*), *l’Oasi* (retired peoples’ group), the *Oratorio* (youth center), the Pastoral Council, and catechism school. Others volunteer (and there is overlap between groups) in the parish office, and with the liturgy, and with various celebrations that take place at the church (annual saint day, Christmas sale, etc.). In the parish but not run by it is a Food Bank, staffed by many volunteers who attend the church. The church is largely sustained by funds collecting during offerings and by pledges. For some restoration work (the basic work), the church has gotten funds from the Italian state, due to the church’s status as an historic site. The church also has special collections during the major religious holidays (particularly Christmas and Easter) that go to particular causes, such as the poor in the parish, or for a school run by missionaries in Africa. Parishioners are notified in various ways of funding requests and needs: mostly the monthly bulletin that can be picked up at the church, and the posting of the monthly budget revenues and expenses on a bulletin board at the main entrance to the church.

**St Pierre de Montrouge, Paris, France**

Located in the non-touristy 14th *arrondissment*, it has about 12 paid staff and between 500–600 volunteers just to run the church office and its main organizations. There are 50,000 people in the parish, about 4,000 attend mass weekly (with about 2,100 coming on weekends, excluding the major holidays). The parish is largely middle-class, upper middle-class, with an immigrant community as well. It has six priests and one deacon. There are lots of volunteer groups, many very active. As in Santa Maria alla Fontana, many parishioners volunteer with other Catholic charities in the parish, that are not run by the parish (*Secours Catholique*, Saint Vincent de Paul or SVdP, *Comité Catholique contre la Faim et pour le développment* or CCFD). They are given some support by the parish, depending on the preferences of the priest and advice of the parish Economic Council. Some 80% of its expenses have to be met by tithing and other collections.

**Our Mother of Divine Grace Ballygall parish, Dublin Ireland**

Ballygall is outside the city center, within Dublin (Dublin 11), in a hilly middle-class neighborhood. It has about 6,200 parishioners (90% Catholic), about 25% (1,300) of the Catholics attend mass weekly. In contrast to those in Milan, Paris, and Istanbul, Dublin parishes are known by the name of the parish, not by the name of the local parish church. It is staffed by two priests, a sister, one sacristan, and a parish secretary (paid). There are lots of volunteers in a variety of organizations, and the laity is quite involved in religious services (the liturgy, the children’s mass), in baptism teams, in funeral team. They are beginning to get trained to do healing services in response to the paucity of priests. As are all parishes in the Dublin diocese, Ballygall is being clustered with four others, with the aim of sharing resources. Again, this is due largely to the dearth of priests. The parishes have had concerns about getting volunteers for activities, and there are worries about whether the next generations will be as engaged. The Ballygall parish was not one in which any of the child abuse/pedophile cases were in, but many of the interviewees and the priest voluntarily brought up the scandal and discussed how hard it has been on the victims, on them, and how it has led many Catholics to quit coming to mass. The Moderator of the Curia also brought it up. The interviewees who broached the subject always distinguished between the local parish church, toward which they retained favorable attitudes, and the institutional (or diocesan) Church, toward which they were critical.

**Basilique-Cathédrale Saint Esprit, Istanbul, Turkey**

There are about 2,000 Catholics living in Istanbul. The Basilique Cathedrale Saint Esprit has about 200–250 congregants. The church has three priests. We were told that a fourth priest had just retired before we arrived. The Head Vicar also resides in this Church as this is the center of the Vicarate. The church attendees are from three different groups of people: Levantines (the French and Italian immigrants inherited from the Ottoman Empire); immigrants from the Philippines, most of whom are nannies; and immigrants from African countries, especially from Congo. The church also receives many Catholic tourists because it is a historically important church, and it provides religious services to the tourists as well. In the summers, there is a service every day at 6:00 p.m. in the church. The immigrants, some of whom are in Turkey illegally, live under difficult conditions. Most of the personal charities go to these immigrants’ needs.

**MUSLIM ASSOCIATIONS**

**Ihsander, Istanbul, Turkey**

Ihsander is a benevolent businessman’s association, affiliated with the Gülen movement, offering religious services to its followers unofficially. It also runs several charitable activities. Because organizing around religion is legally not allowed in Turkey, Ihsander cannot have official status as a religious association or organization. The association has about 350 active members; however, it offers religious and charitable services to thousands of other people. When the interviews were being conducted, the most pressing agenda was construction of a dormitory that would house more than one thousand high school students. The members were trying to gather donations from the people around them to facilitate the construction.

**Yunus Emre Cultural Association, Paris, France**

The Turkish population in France is about 600,000. Almost three-quarters of them live in Paris. The Gülen community has six associations in Paris. The Yunus Emre Cultural Association offers religious and cultural services to its members. It serves about 500–600 people. Some of the activities that the association organizes are: weekly religious education courses, weekend school for the Turkish school-children in which they are taught about Islam and Turkish culture. The association also organizes charitable activities to help people around the world. When we were there, they organized a program in which they collected help for Pakistani flood victims. The organization is also affiliated with a private Turkish school. Finally, it organizes interfaith and intercultural activities to inform the French people about Islam and Turkish community. Our interviews were just before the Eid al-Adha, a major Muslim festival, in which poor are provided with meat. The community was busy with gathering money to get meat for the Pakistani flood victims.

**Alba Intercultural Association, Milan, Italy**

The Turkish community in Italy is very small (not more than 15,000). There are about 4,000 Turks living in Milan, Italy. There is only one Gülen community association in Milan, Alba Intercultural Association. There are about 200 people who are somehow affiliated with the association. As in Paris, the association offers weekly religious education lectures, weekend school for the Turkish immigrant schoolchildren, and intercultural/interfaith activities. In Milan, the association focuses more on intercultural activities than on religious education for Muslims. The main target of the association is the Italian people. In doing so, they aim to inform them about Islam and Turkish culture. Unlike other cities, weekly Friday prayers are performed in the association. Like Paris, our interviews were just before the Eid al-Adha, a major Muslim festival, in which poor are provided with meat. The community was busy with gathering support for the Pakistani flood victims.

**Turkish-Irish Educational and Cultural Society, Dublin, Ireland**

The Turkish immigrant community in Ireland is the smallest among all the four cities. An officer from the Turkish embassy said that there is about 5,000 Turks living in Ireland, most of which live in Dublin. The Gülen community has only one association in Dublin, TIECS (Turkish-Irish Educational and Cultural Society). The association is the smallest of all. There are about 100–125 people somehow affiliated with the association. They have unorganized weekend classes for the Turkish school-children. Like Italy, their major concentration is interfaith/intercultural dialogue. The major concentration during my stay in Dublin was rental of a bigger place for the association, preferably in the city center. The Gülen community in Ireland also had campaigns for Pakistani flood victims during the Eid al-Adha festival.

Estimates of mass attendance in the parishes ranged from about 8% of 50,000 in Saint Pierre de Montrouge, Paris, 15% of 14,000 in Santa Maria alla Fontana, Milan, 20% of 5,500 in Ballygal, Dublin, and 12% of 2000 parishioners in Saint Esprit, Istanbul. Although we do not have exact numbers for Turks living in European countries and we do not know what percentages of them are practicing Muslims, the following data might be helpful to see the size of our associations. Ihsander in Istanbul has about 350 active members and the association serves about 20,000 people. There are about 450,000 Turks living in Paris, where the Yunus Emre Cultural Association offers religious services to about 500–600 people. There are about 4,000 Turks living in Milan; the Alba Intercultural Association serves about 200 people who are somehow affiliated with the association. There are about 5,000 Turks living in Ireland, most of whom live in Dublin. The Turkish-Irish Educational and Cultural Society serves to the Turkish community with about 100–125 people affiliated with the association.

Access to Santa Maria alla Fontana was by direct referral from a scholar of Catholicism in Italy; access to Our Lady of Divine Grace Ballygal was by referral from the Moderator of the Curia of the Dublin diocese after we had been granted permission by the Dublin Archbishop to conduct the research in the diocese; access to Saint Pierre de Montrouge was by direct appeal to the priest; access to Basilique-Cathédrale Saint Esprit was by direct appeal to the priest. We had explained in our contact letters what kind of parish we hoped to conduct the study in: not exceptional, not in an extremely wealthy or poor neighborhood, and not in a tourist zone. With only two Latin rite parishes, there was little choice in Istanbul. Saint Esprit was willing to grant access. We were not able to get detailed demographic information about the dioceses, including estimates of mass attendance in all parishes, from the dioceses, save in the case of Dublin. However, for Dublin the source requested that the information remain confidential and unpublished, thus we are not allowed to use it.

Şerafettin Pektaş, the President of Intercultural Dialogue Foundation in Brussels put us in contact with the associations in Paris, Milan, and Dublin. We chose Yunus Emre Cultural Association in Paris since it was the largest among the six Gülen community centers in Paris. The association is located in the northwest suburbs of Paris. For Milan and Dublin, we had only one association available in each city. We conducted our fieldwork at Alba Intercultural Association in Milan and Turkish Irish Educational and Cultural Society in Dublin. The cultural centers in Milan and Paris are both located at the city center. Muharrem Atlığ of Journalists and Writers Foundation, a leading Gülen-affiliated civil society organization put us in contact with Ihsander in Istanbul. Ihsander is located in the northwestern suburbs of Istanbul in the European side of the city.

**NOTE ABOUT THE GÜLEN MOVEMENT**

Islam has a wider variety of practices and orientations, some of which vary by ethnicity or nationality, than does Catholicism. We hold the national origin and religious orientation constant in Islam by focusing upon the cultural centers established by the Turkish Gülen movement in our four countries. We could not study mosque associations across all four countries, because in Turkey, the state controls the mosques. These are used only for prayer purposes. Because of the diversity of religious groups in Turkey, any movement we chose would be subject to question. Roughly speaking, there are four types of Islamic groups in Turkey: (1) Official Islam: The version of Islam sponsored by government; (2) Sufism (or Tariqas): Typical Sufi organizations which are structured around charismatic religious leaders; (3) Political Islam: The version of Islam which emphasizes political activism and transform the state in a way to make Islamic values influential in state and society; (4) Social Islam: The Islamic communities that try to increase awareness of Islam and are mostly active in social sectors such as education, welfare, and health care. All these groups, including the official state version, are mainstream Sunni. Islam’s basic message of charity is constant across them. Sufi groups are not widespread across the country and are relatively more closed to outsiders. Political groups concentrate their activities on political mobilization and do not organize around religious activities and religious mobilization. Gülen associations, on the other hand, are locus of religious mobilization. They have a broader scope of activities including charity, education, religious services, interfaith dialogue and social services. They are more open to society than the Sufi groups. In this regard Gülen movement seems to be the best fit to compare the Catholic Church. Furthermore, the Gülen movement is the only Turkish Islamic movement that has an organizational presence in all of our case countries, namely Turkey, France, Italy and Ireland.

In December 2013, after a serious corruption probe was initiated by the judiciary in Turkey, Turkish Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdogan accused the prosecutors of being affiliated with the Gülen movement and acting with US and Israel to depose the government. This incident has suggested that there is a political dimension of the movement. Whether or not the Gülen movement is involved in the controversy, it first and foremost is a social Islamic movement. We met people who contributed to the charitable activities of the movement in four cities and our interviews included questions about religious and community-based motivations behind the generosity of the adherents. None of our interviewees had any affiliation with the judiciary branch of Turkey. Furthermore, the movement was not at the center of such a controversy when we conducted the interviews in 2010. Neither our questions nor the replies we got from more than 120 respondents had any hints of political mobilization or agenda. At the center of our conversations were religious and community-based motivations behind the generosity of our respondents.

**Profile of the Interviewees for the semi-structured interviews**

**Table 1. Basic Demographics: Muslim Interviewees**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Muslims in Istanbul** | **Muslims in Paris** | **Muslims in Milan** | **Muslims in Dublin** |
| **Total Number** | 31 | 31 | 32 | 30 |
| **Female** | 12 | 10 | 8 | 6 |
| **Male** | 19 | 21 | 24 | 24 |
| **Age** | 18-24: 1  25-36: 20  37-55: 9  56-70: 1  71-: 0 | 18-24: 1  25-36: 15  37-55: 14  56-70: 1  71-: 0 | 18-24: 4  25-36: 18  37-55: 7  56-70: 0  71-: 0 | 18-24: 3  25-36: 18  37-55: 7  56-70: 0  71-: 0 |
| **Socio-economic Status\*** | 1: 0  2: 14  3: 10  4: 1  5: 2  No Ans: 4 | 1: 3  2: 10  3: 8  4: 5  5: 0  No Ans: 5 | 1: 0  2: 13  3: 8  4: 7  5: 0  No Ans: 4 | 1: 1  2: 6  3: 3  4: 9  5: 1  No Ans: 10 |

**Table 2: Basic Demographics: Catholic Interviewees**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | ***Catholics in Istanbul*** | ***Catholics in Paris*** | ***Catholics in Milan*** | ***Catholics in Dublin*** |
| **Total Number** | 28 | 21 | 21 | 24 |
| **Female** | 9 | 13 | 12 | 16 |
| **Male** | 19 | 8 | 9 | 8 |
| **Age** | 18-24: 0  25-36: 9  37-55: 10  56-70: 8  71-: 1 | 18-24: 1  25-36: 1  37-55: 6  56-70: 6  71-: 1 | 18-24: 1  25-36: 3  37-55: 9  56-70: 7  71-: 1 | 18-24: 0  25-36: 1  37-55: 9  56-70: 10  71-: 4 |
| **Socio-economic Status\*** | 1: 0  2: 11  3: 10  4: 7  5: 0  No Ans: 0 | 1: 3  2: 9  3: 3  4: 1  5: 0  No Ans: 5 | 1: 0  2: 6  3: 9  4: 0  5: 0  No Ans: 7 | 1: 0  2: 22  3: 1  4: 0  5: 0  No Ans:1 |

\*Self-reported socio-economic status.

1= Lower class;

2= Lower middle class;

3= Middle-class;

4= Upper middle-class;5= Upper class.